

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26018

Title: Contribution of alpha-fetoprotein in liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00227509

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-03-28 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-04-12 21:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors investigated the significance of AFP in liver transplantation for HCC. However, there is few novelty and interesting speculation in this review article.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26018

Title: Contribution of alpha-fetoprotein in liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00068250

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-03-28 10:55

Date reviewed: 2016-04-15 22:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1 The authors state that "Hepatocellular carcinoma is the second most common cause of death from cancer worldwide". But most literature presents that "HCC is the third cancer related death worldwide". 2 AFP should not be isolated to discuss as a predictor of HCC recurrence. Several factors are related to HCC recurrence after liver transplantation including viral hepatitis, cirrhosis, and vascular invasion. Even in patients with normal serum level of AFP, HCC also recurs after transplantation. 3 There is often a dynamic change in serum level of AFP in patients on the waiting list for transplantation, especially those who have received locoregional therapy as a bridge to transplantation. This issue must be discussed. 4 There are typo and grammatical errors in the manuscript.