

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15770

Title: Platelet to lymphocyte ratio as a novel prognostic tool for gallbladder carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03002166

Reviewer's country: Hungary

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-09 09:46

Date reviewed: 2014-12-22 04:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors confirmed the predictive power of PLR in a rare malignancy at first time in the literature. The findings were supported with adequate statistical analysis. In the conclusion they formulate themselves one of the inadequacies of the manuscript: the disproportionateness due to the stage distribution. It would make the manuscript more valuable if the therapeutic methods behind the follow-up data would be known. Some questions to the authors: - The authors wrote: "Patients who had been previously treated for GBC and who had metastasis were excluded." How is it then possible that so many patients with stage IV have been enrolled? - How was the histopathological distribution? - How were the patients treated? As most patients were of advanced stage how many patients underwent radical operation? How many cases were unresectable? How many patients received neoadjuvant chemotherapy? - Were any patients excluded due to other causes such as ongoing inflammation (pneumonia, cholecystitis, Crohn's disease etc.) or anemia?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15770

Title: Platelet to lymphocyte ratio as a novel prognostic tool for gallbladder carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02527871

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-09 09:46

Date reviewed: 2014-12-13 14:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, Pang et al. retrospectively summarized preoperative serum level of platelet and lymphocyte count from 316 surgical GBC patients and calculated platelet to lymphocyte ratio (PLR). PASW Statistics 18.0 software was used to analyze the association of PLR and clinical characteristics, univariate analysis and multivariate analysis which suggested PLR was a novel prognostic factor for GBC. The study is well-supported by the data but lack of novelty which has been reported in several other cancers. Some important issues should be addressed before acceptance: 1. Is platelet or lymphocyte alone as a predictive factor in GBC? 2. What is the possible mechanisms underlying its prognostic role in GBC? Please make a description in Discussion part. 3. First paragraph of Discussion part should be transferred to Introduction part.