

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18263

Title: Cartilage oligomeric matrix protein: A novel non-invasive marker for assessing cirrhosis and risk of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02861134

Reviewer's country: Bulgaria

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 11:37

Date reviewed: 2015-05-08 03:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Starting part of this paper is excellent, specially the abstract. It is concise and organized. The study is a timely research. Objectives are consistent with literature review and analysis. The paper can be recommended to publish with the prior approval of the editorial board.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18263

Title: Cartilage oligomeric matrix protein: A novel non-invasive marker for assessing cirrhosis and risk of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 01588404

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 11:37

Date reviewed: 2015-05-04 13:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study that has used COMP level as a marker for advanced cirrhosis and for identifying patients at risk of HCC development. A well planned study overall. The major criticism is a single point measurement. A serial / follow up measurement data may have added more mechanistic information regarding the utility of COMP level in following patients with Chronic liver disease.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18263

Title: Cartilage oligomeric matrix protein: A novel non-invasive marker for assessing cirrhosis and risk of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02441174

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-04-24 11:37

Date reviewed: 2015-05-06 03:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The work is very interesting and innovative. The search for markers is very important in assessing the risk of hepatocellular carcinoma, of the liver. Although elevated levels of COMP was observed in only 22-36% of patients with chronic liver disease. The original study conducted on large groups of patients is very valuable. Below are a few minor comments to the reviewed publication. 1. In discussion the authors did not provide acronyms RA and OA. 2. As a general reference work contains too little of the literature from a last few years. The abstract,introduction are clear for the reader. The discussion is quite well planned. All issues raised by the authors are presented clearly and understandably Charts in part A of Table 3 are not clear for reader.