

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Surgical Procedures

ESPS manuscript NO: 13958

Title: Sentinel lymph node mapping for malignant melanoma of the external auditory canal

Reviewer's code: 00732053

Reviewer's country: Afghanistan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-09-10 10:30

Date reviewed: 2014-09-10 14:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good paper.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Surgical Procedures

ESPS manuscript NO: 13958

Title: Sentinel lymph node mapping for malignant melanoma of the external auditory canal

Reviewer's code: 00646608

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-09-10 10:30

Date reviewed: 2014-09-10 22:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting case report, but of unclear value in terms of changing management

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Surgical Procedures

ESPS manuscript NO: 13958

Title: Sentinel lymph node mapping for malignant melanoma of the external auditory canal

Reviewer's code: 02445848

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-09-10 10:30

Date reviewed: 2014-09-11 16:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript describes application of lymph node mapping and biopsy in a case of a primary malignant melanoma of the external auditory canal. The case report is well presented and easy to read. The title and the abstract reflect the topic and contents of the case. The presentation has some minor limitations to be considered: 1) Even if no IRB approval was required, under my personal point of view, a consent from the patient should be obtained. 2) Since this is a retrospective study, more information regarding the treatment and follow up of the patient would add valuable indications, in particular when considering extremely rare conditions such as the melanoma of the external auditory canal. I would suggest to add additional information (treatment and follow up) in the description of the case. 3) Since this is a case report, the conclusion cannot "demonstrate", the conclusion may "suggest". Obviously further study are needed in order to verify the safety and efficacy of this technique. Moreover, only the long term follow up of the patient may provide valuable information when considering the clinical efficacy of this approach. I would suggest to consider this issue and to discuss it.