



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 83112

Title: Combined MPFL and MPFL reconstruction in recurrent patellar instability: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03999237

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MS

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: Iran

Manuscript submission date: 2023-01-24

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-03-28 17:56

Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-09 03:21

Review time: 11 Days and 9 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written review , number of studies included Few suggestions Table 1 requires references to be added to each of the studies a recent review Aicale R, Maffulli N. Combined medial patellofemoral and medial patellotibial reconstruction for patellar instability: a PRISMA systematic review. Journal of orthopaedic surgery and research 2020; 15(1) [DOI: 10.1186/s13018-020-02072-z] was done with relevant articles included the current paper has included the article below that has 8 patients who also underwent tibial tubercle osteotomy - this would not be appropriate for this review. Ebied AM, El-Kholy W. Reconstruction of the medial patello-femoral and patello-tibial ligaments for treatment of patellar instability. Knee Surgery, Sports Traumatology, Arthroscopy 2012; 20(5): 926-932 the conclusion stating that the combined procedure would be beneficial has to be made with caution and the following 2 articles need inclusion in the current review to state that the combined procedure's benefits must be made with caution. 1. Archives of Orthopaedics Research Article <https://www.scientificarchives.com/journal/archives-of-orthopaedics> The Role of the MPFL and MPTL in Patellar Stability – A Biomechanical Study James P. Halloran^{1,2,}

Amanda O. Esquivel¹ , Allison M. Cracchiolo¹ , Chaoyang Chen^{1*} Stephen E. Lemos^{1,2*1} Department of Orthopaedic Surgery and Sports Medicine, Detroit, Detroit Medical Center, Detroit, Michigan, USA 2DMC Sports Medicine Orthopaedic Surgery Fellowship Program, Detroit Medical Center, Detroit, Michigan, USA * 2.Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc . 2021 Mar;29(3):793-799. doi: 10.1007/s00167-020-06015-3. Epub 2020 Apr 28. Isolated MPLT reconstruction fails to restore lateral patellar stability when compared to MPFL reconstruction Luiz Felipe Ambra 1 2, Carlos Eduardo Franciozi 3 4 5, Amy Phan 6, Flavio Faloppa 3, Andreas H Gomoll 7 the paper and the conclusion needs to convey a clear message regarding the pros and cons of the combined procedure before making a recommendation.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 83112

Title: Combined MPFL and MPFL reconstruction in recurrent patellar instability: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03999237

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MS

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: Iran

Manuscript submission date: 2023-01-24

Reviewer chosen by: Yu-Jie Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-05-09 13:09

Reviewer performed review: 2023-05-11 00:33

Review time: 1 Day and 11 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

All the recommendations have been suitably addressed