

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5646

**Title:** Hepatocellular carcinoma and liver metastases from colorectal cancer

**Reviewer code:** 00185818

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-19 17:57

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-24 16:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

I read this manuscript with interest. It is a clear cut case report that highlights the co-existence of different malignant tumours in the liver. Although it is well written and well documented, I do not think that the scientific value is high enough to make it worth publishing in this journal.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5646

**Title:** Hepatocellular carcinoma and liver metastases from colorectal cancer

**Reviewer code:** 02447023

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-19 17:57

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-28 22:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This manuscript is interesting but the evidence have not highly scientific points and do not show novel information.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5646

**Title:** Hepatocellular carcinoma and liver metastases from colorectal cancer

**Reviewer code:** 01561000

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-19 17:57

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-30 12:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comment to the Authors Marcello Maida et al. reported the rare and interesting case of Hepatocellular carcinoma and synchronous liver metastasis from colorectal cancer in cirrhosis. Careful observation and discussion regarding diagnosis and management of primary HCC and liver metastasis from colorectal cancer have been done, but there have been several points need to be addressed. 1: Why did the ascites increase after surgery and RFA in spite of good liver function? The author does not mention the cause. The author should describe possible causes of it. 2: The authors should add detailed clinical course after the surgical treatment: subsequent course of ascites-treatment, and cause of death (cause of progressive liver failure). 2: Fig. 3 in page 8; "a luminal narrowing with marked segmental circumferential thickening of the hepatic flexure of the colon", this findings are hard to recognize from only Fig3. More descriptive pictures should be listed. 3: Line 12-13 in page 3, "Liver is the most frequent metastatic site for patients with CRC; metastatic nodules are present in more that 50% of cases at presentation. ", is "that" wrong of "than" in this sentence? And cite references should be listed here. 4: Line 27 in page 5, "CRHP" should be corrected as "CRMP".

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5646

**Title:** Hepatocellular carcinoma and liver metastases from colorectal cancer

**Reviewer code:** 02441391

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-19 17:57

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-01 00:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript described a case of synchronous HCC and CRC with liver metastases in individual with compensated liver cirrhosis. What is the important points for the management of colon cancer in cirrhotic patients with liver nodules. Do we need to perform liver biopsies for all liver lesions before ablative therapy or surgery for colon cancer with suspicion of liver metastasis? What is the risk of tumor seeding for percutaneous liver biopsy in this context? How does the histologic information of liver lesions change the management in this patient?