

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Virology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 15063

**Title:** Diagnostic assays developed for the control of Foot-and- Mouth Disease in India

**Reviewer's code:** 00504096

**Reviewer's country:** France

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2014-11-10 08:14

**Date reviewed:** 2015-01-02 05:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present review article, the diagnostic assays developed and validated for FMD and their contribution in FMD control program is reviewed. While, the review article is relatively well-written but several comments are raised to improve it in a revised version for enhancing the scientific style for publication as following: - Please consider a general introductory section on all available assays that are being employed globally for detection of FMDV by getting use of recent review articles (a few articles are provided below) and their provided citations (before focusing on specific applications in INDIA) and in Conclusion section, please try to compare what is being done generally throughout the world and in specific in INDIA and suggest your opinions. The development of oral fluid-based diagnostics and applications in veterinary medicine, Prickett JR, Zimmerman JJ, Anim Health Res Rev. 2010 Dec;11(2):207-16. doi: 10.1017/S1466252310000010. Epub 2010 Mar 5. Review. A review of RT-PCR technologies used in veterinary virology and disease control: sensitive and specific diagnosis of five livestock diseases notifiable to the World Organisation for Animal Health, Hoffmann B, Beer M, Reid SM, Mertens P, Oura CA, van Rijn PA, Slomka MJ, Banks J, Brown IH, Alexander DJ, King DP, Vet Microbiol. 2009 Oct 20;139(1-2):1-23. doi:



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

10.1016/j.vetmic.2009.04.034. Epub 2009 May 6. Review. Molecular diagnosis of viral diseases, present trends and future aspects A view from the OIE Collaborating Centre for the Application of Polymerase Chain Reaction Methods for Diagnosis of Viral Diseases in Veterinary Medicine, Belák S.Vaccine. 2007 Jul 26;25(30):5444-52. Epub 2006 Dec 28. Review. - Please provide proper reference for section 1 within the text (FMD virus detection in clinical materials. - The review article would be improved by designing a figure for the genome of the virus to describe the genes and proteins that are currently being targeted for ELISA or PCR-based diagnosis with detailed specifications. - The review article suffers from lack of Tables to summarize the provided information. Please arrange Tables to summarize provided information on: i) Diagnostic assays for detection of FMDV including columns that describe advantages and disadvantages of each assay in a comparative manner, ii) Tables to summarize the informations provided in section 2, 3, so on. - Please provide a Title for Table 1 and 2. - Please provide conclusive description for Figure 1 in its legend.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Virology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 15063

**Title:** Diagnostic assays developed for the control of Foot-and- Mouth Disease in India

**Reviewer's code:** 00504077

**Reviewer's country:** Egypt

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2014-11-10 08:14

**Date reviewed:** 2014-12-30 20:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

good article