

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Surgical Procedures

ESPS manuscript NO: 14522

Title: Operative management of acute diverticulitis in immunosuppressed compared to immunocompetent patients: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00057983

Reviewer's country: Taiwan, China

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-10-09 19:20

Date reviewed: 2014-10-28 02:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1.This manuscript seems to include the largest series of the related topic. 2.The authors review several large studies and make a meta-analysis of this topic in several aspects, including demographic data, clinical presentation, indication and choice of operation, post-operative morbidity and mortality, length of hospital stay, long-term outcome and non-operative management. The analysis is detailed. Despite most results are as our expectation, the results seem reliable. 3.About the limitations of this study, I think it is inevitable and acceptable.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Surgical Procedures

ESPS manuscript NO: 14522

Title: Operative management of acute diverticulitis in immunosuppressed compared to immunocompetent patients: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00505440

Reviewer's country: Australia

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-10-09 19:20

Date reviewed: 2014-10-28 18:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very nice systematic review worthy of publication. Major comment 1) What is the authors' rationale for including patients with extra-colonic concurrent neoplasia as IMS? This needs to be elaborated in the methods section 2) The Tables need to be redone - please see the comments below. Minor comments 1) Background, 3rd last line. Please clarify that the reference 8 mainly involved patients on steroids as the statement made dilutes the novelty of the authors' current review. 2) 11. Non operative management, line 1 - please correct was to 'were' 3) Once the authors use an abbreviation, they should maintain this format in the rest of the manuscript. Eg limitations of the study, line 1 - the complete word immunocompromised. Instead the authors could have used IMS 4) Please number the pages as it makes indicating the locations of corrections easier for the reviewers 5) Figure 1 - the formatting has been lost. Please check 6) All the tables need to be formatted. Non standard abbreviations such as 'w' should be removed 7) Please provide the full forms of all abbreviations used. Eg in the tables, UTI, DVT, SD, etc have not been elaborated 8) It would be better for the reader if the authors inserted the reference number beside the author name for every entry in the tables 9) In Table



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

2 - the number 9 at the end of the column on types of studies makes no sense.