

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13148

Title: The high pre-transplant neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio indicates poor prognosis of patients with acute on chronic liver failure after liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 00012499

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-08-08 11:28

Date reviewed: 2014-09-09 21:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Nice study, but as presented now appearing pointless. Results would have clinical relevance if alternative treatments than LT were offered to high NLR patients. Furthermore, the commonly assessed marker creatine is equally predictive... Hopefully the paper can be revised to show the merits of NLR assessment prior to LT (or alternative treatment?). Specific comments: 1. abstract: background: Little is realized about the negative effects of increased (NLR) on prognosis.... methods: ...Optimal cutoff on NLR was assessed by..... conclusion: does this knowledge affect treatment of patients? 2. introduction, last paragraph: Is there any clinical use for this knowledge? In other words, is treatment affected? 3. Discussion, p14 With creatinine equally good, is there any gain in using NLR. Do both factors combined give further improvement in clinical testing?

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13148

Title: The high pre-transplant neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio indicates poor prognosis of patients with acute on chronic liver failure after liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 00225294

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-08-08 11:28

Date reviewed: 2014-09-11 01:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This work focuses on the neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio in patients undergoing OLT. The work has a quite simple structure and the results appear to be consistent. Overall, the guarantee in the identification of the PBC populations appears to be the main source of potential error in the accomplishment of the conclusions. I recommend the authors to maintain a parallel line on the values recruited by the clinical laboratory in patients of different pathologies. Main Points: 1. Is it possible to identify PBC subsets among the raw values given by the authors (CD4/CD8+, N1 N2 for neutrophils etc.): This is now days important if available, in order to assess the basic mechanisms governing the phenomena observed by the gastroenterologists 2. Could you please give the same info after 1 month? Are the values maintained? 3. English needs to be improved and the paper shortened just to focus in the specific issues addressed by the authors.