

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31507

Title: Characterization of a new monoclonal anti-glypican-3 antibody specific for the hepatocellular carcinoma cell line, HepG2

Reviewer's code: 00070422

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-11-23 15:07

Date reviewed: 2016-11-24 10:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

HSPG was isolated from human liver. Preliminary results showed that it was detected by rabbit anti-glypican. The 1E4-1D9 was raised against human liver HSPG and specific antigen was characterized. Amino acid sequence analysis revealed that the antigen recognized by mAb 1E4-1D9 specific molecule contained no transmembrane region. It has 15 cysteines and 11 putative- and 6 predicted N-glycosylation sites. The sequence matched to all PDZ domain protein with 85.6% match to glypican-3. The studies of co-expression and co-precipitation demonstrated that mAb 1E4-1D9 could compete with anti-glypican-3. The findings suggest that the antigen recognized by 1E4-1D9 is glypican-3. Moreover, findings revealed that FYCO1 co-precipitated with glypican-3 using mAb 1E4-1D9, suggesting that FYCO1 is a partner molecule of glypican-3. Although Author's preliminary results of mAb 1E4-1D9 showed that it could react with human HepG2 cells. 1. The question is why mAb 1E4-1D9 only react with glypican-3 in HepG2 cells or all HCC cells? 2. How about other HCC cells that could produce GPC-3?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31507

Title: Characterization of a new monoclonal anti-glypican-3 antibody specific for the hepatocellular carcinoma cell line, HepG2

Reviewer's code: 02992983

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-11-23 15:07

Date reviewed: 2016-12-02 20:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The mAb will be a good tool to study the function of Glypican-3, I hope it works in the future study.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31507

Title: Characterization of a new monoclonal anti-glypican-3 antibody specific for the hepatocellular carcinoma cell line, HepG2

Reviewer's code: 03074879

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-11-23 15:07

Date reviewed: 2016-12-05 15:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Early detection of HCC is very important to study, the Glypican-3 is a good point to research, so topic of paper is novel and design of experiment is precise. You can express the research method and train of thought in content at length, but it is a little tedious. I think you can make a diagram to describe the methods, which can include most steps of experiment. So the reader can easy to understand your content with a diagram, In discussion, you just say the advantage of the Glypican-3 compared with the family of HSPG. You should tell the method of diagnosis of the HCC except the HSPG's family, then compare with the Glypican-3, which can better highlight the advantage of the Glypican-3.