

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26795

Title: Circulating predictive and diagnostic biomarkers for hepatitis B virus-associated hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02937551

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 14:27

Date reviewed: 2016-05-10 10:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, the authors widely consult a lot of papers, systematically list several new putative circulating biomarkers to predict or diagnose HCC, and give us an overview on the current understandings and recent progress in the field of diagnostic and predictive circulating biomarkers for hepatocellular carcinoma in chronically infected HBV patients and discusses the future prospects.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26795

Title: Circulating predictive and diagnostic biomarkers for hepatitis B virus-associated hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03444332

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 14:27

Date reviewed: 2016-05-22 21:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Up to 50% of newly diagnosed HCC cases are attributed to chronic HBV infection. The authors of this manuscript reviewed the current progress of circulating predictive and diagnostic biomarkers for HBV-associated HCC systematically, and discussed the future prospects. The manuscript is suitable to published in WJG.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26795

Title: Circulating predictive and diagnostic biomarkers for hepatitis B virus-associated hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03473526

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 14:27

Date reviewed: 2016-05-31 22:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reviewed current literatures for circulating biomarkers for HBV-associated hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). This review manuscript will be largely improved after adding the following information: (1) For each biomarker, please specify whether they are liver specific and liver cancer specific proteins; if not, what other cell types and/or cancers can contribute. The authors did this for some of the biomarkers but not all. (2) For each biomarker, please highlight the most reliable method for detection of the specific biomarker and add a summary column for detection method in table one with citation. (3) In AFP-13 section, the sensitivity ranges from 36%-96% which is a quite wide range. Please explain/discuss the reason for such a high range among different studies and highlight the data from some rigorous studies. (4) It's interesting to see miRNA as promising biomarkers for HCC. Please add more details about the functions and downstream targets/signaling for miRNA-21 and miRNA-122, and highlight some studies on them in HCC. (5) There are several studies on circulating tumor cells for HCC. Please review some of these studies and discuss whether this could be useful for detection of HCC. (6) In discussion,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

there is a brief paragraph about SNP, please discuss both germline and somatic gene mutation analysis that could link to HCC, and the usage of gene mutation for detection and prediction for HCC development. (7) In discussion, last paragraph, please discuss in more details the systems biology techniques that can be applied on liver tissue to predict HCC development with citations.