

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17316

Title: A Novel Variant Syndrome Associated with Congenital Hepatic Fibrosis

Reviewer's code: 02937636

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-03-01 13:34

Date reviewed: 2015-03-29 16:15

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, authors described three siblings who suffered from congenital hepatic fibrosis accompanied with retinitis pigmentosa, mental retardation, nystagmus, high-arched palate, truncal obesity and advanced myopia. This might be a novel mutation of oculo-encephalo-hepato-renal syndrome. These cases are very rare and interesting. However, the manuscript should be revised in some places. 1. Shortening case report and discussion sections, make them more accurate and standardization to meet the criteria of WJG; 2. English writing didn't meet the criteria of WJG either, such as (1) In Core Tip section: "...rare disorder (?) disease..., many (?) different syndromic disorders", (2) In Introduction section: "The clinical manifestations of CHF are nonspecific, however(?), making the diagnosis of this disorder extremely difficult." (3) In Patient 1: "A needle biopsy of the liver showed an increased number of irregularly shaped bile ducts with nodularity of the liver parenchyma accentuated by fibrous septa typical of CHF (Figure 1)." based on this description, how to explain Figure legend 1?