

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 57090

Title: Malnutrition and non-compliance to nutritional recommendations in patients with cirrhosis are associated with a lower survival

Reviewer's code: 05085789

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Senior Lecturer

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-25

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-28 03:06

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-28 11:44

Review time: 8 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript entitled “Malnutrition and non-compliance to nutritional recommendations in patients with cirrhosis are associated with a lower survival”, the authors demonstrated that the prevalence of malnutrition was high in patients with advanced cirrhosis and was related in part to a low adherence to nutritional recommendations. In addition, they also concluded that appropriate protein intake could increase the survival. While the findings of this study are of interest in a part, the current study is lacking the cutting edge to be accepted for publication. To overcome this limitation, authors are recommended to modify the manuscript according to the comments which are mentioned below. 1) In general, fully compensated patients without any previous decompensation (n=22) are to be defined as the compensated group and re-compensated patients (n=15, 40.5%) should be treated as the decompensated one. Additionally, authors should better show the validation of setting the definition of “decompensation” in this study. Nevertheless, all the data analysed in this study would be less persuasive. 2) Furthermore, to diminish the unbalance of registered number of patients in both groups (compensated and decompensated), authors should better include more fully compensated cases. 3) The data of branched-chain amino acids to tyrosine ratio value (BTR), body mass index (BMI) and skeletal muscle index (SMI, <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41430-017-0034-5>) would be important in this study. 4) Authors should better show the flowchart of patient recruitment. 5) The image resolution of supplementary Fig.S1 was coarse.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 57090

Title: Malnutrition and non-compliance to nutritional recommendations in patients with cirrhosis are associated with a lower survival

Reviewer's code: 02462179

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, N/A, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-25

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-30 07:27

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-04 13:29

Review time: 5 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors assessed the prevalence of malnutrition in patients with advanced cirrhosis and evaluated its impact on survival. They concluded that the prevalence of malnutrition is high among patients with advanced cirrhosis and might be related in part to a low adherence to nutritional recommendations, especially with regards to protein intake. Overall, this manuscript is well written. However, there are still several problems that should be considered. Comments: 1. The sample size was relatively small for multivariate analysis. The sample size should be estimated prior to the study. 2. The findings should be validated in another cohort.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 57090

Title: Malnutrition and non-compliance to nutritional recommendations in patients with cirrhosis are associated with a lower survival

Reviewer's code: 05085789

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Senior Lecturer

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-25

Reviewer chosen by: Han Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-07-24 01:53

Reviewer performed review: 2020-07-24 03:20

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

The authors well responded to the reviewer's comments. However, there are still some concerns. Even though the authors did not have any data of BTR, it would be actually possible to indicate the scores of body mass index which is simply calculated by height and body weight in the targeted patients, instead. Concerning to the SMI, all what you need is just the images of CT scan by which you and your colleagues had diagnosed some cases of HCC in their early stages in the participants of this study.