

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 15477

Title: Complement activation in the context of stem cells and tissue repair

Reviewer's code: 00609371

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-11-29 17:08

Date reviewed: 2014-12-09 21:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is timely and well-written, even though the language could be a bit more concise and the whole article be more focused. Minor concerns: In page 9, this sentence is inappropriate: "In summary, C3a and C5a can contribute to all three phases of angiogenesis: inflammation, proliferation, and remodeling, and thus the anaphylatoxins can be viewed as indirect angiogenic factors;" the problem with this sentence is two folds: 1) at this point, the remodeling part has not been specific reviewed, so, it is not clear yet whether C3a and C5a indeed contribute to remodeling. 2) I can't see the underlying logic to conclude that "anaphylatoxins can be viewed as indirect angiogenic factors". Maybe I have missed something here. In page 19, "ater" (typo) In page 19-20, the association of "SC5b-9" with HDLs, which in turn, is associated with tissue repair, is indeed intriguing. But the point should be supported by more facts.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 15477

Title: Complement activation in the context of stem cells and tissue repair

Reviewer's code: 01217232

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-11-29 17:08

Date reviewed: 2015-01-12 07:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors have reviewed in detail recent investigations on the role of complement activation in tissue repair, focusing on the effects of C3a and C5a on MSC, HSC, and NSC. C3a and C5a may play a critical role in the chemotaxis, proliferation, and differentiation of stem cells, and interestingly, they may take part in the homing of the transplanted MSC and HSC. The review is interesting and the manuscript is well-organized. This reviewer has no comments to be addressed by the authors.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 15477

Title: Complement activation in the context of stem cells and tissue repair

Reviewer's code: 02438878

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-11-29 17:08

Date reviewed: 2015-01-12 10:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article provides comprehensive overview on complement activation in the context of stem cells and tissue repair. The text and table are informative, the figure vivid and accessible. They first give an introduction to the complement activation cascade, C3a and C5a, late-acting components of the complement system. Then start to explain one by one the role of complement activation in tissue repair and in specific repair processes, including liver regeneration, mesenchymal stem cells (MSC), bone formation, cardiac repair, neurons, neural stem and progenitor cells, embryonic development. In conclusion, this review focuses on the complement activation contributes to tissue repair and regeneration through its effect on stem and progenitor cells, which is an area that needs further investigation.