

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 23187

Title: Retinoblastoma tumor suppressor functions shared by stem cell and cancer cell strategies

Reviewer's code: 03089133

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-11-03 15:29

Date reviewed: 2015-11-10 20:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The goal of this review article was to provide a comprehensive review of RB functions in stem cells and stem cell-like behaviors of cancer cells. It is a well written review covering most recent information. Under the title tumor cell fate, authors have discussed only lung, breast, prostate cancer and soft tissue sarcoma. Authors should add data regarding ovarian and endometrial cancers as well. Planarians and plant stem information about the role of RB in stem cells should be removed. Overall it is a good thorough review.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 23187

Title: Retinoblastoma tumor suppressor functions shared by stem cell and cancer cell strategies

Reviewer's code: 00068723

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-11-03 15:29

Date reviewed: 2015-11-22 20:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review described the whole aspects of RB. The manuscript was well-organized and informative. The concept was interesting that stem cells and cancer stem cells share characteristics related with RB. Although not many literatures report on RB in iPS cells, it would make this review more attractive to discuss RB and iPS cells because this review was invited from World Journal of "Stem Cells". Were there any speculations about RB in maintenance of pluripotency or self-renewal? Another point was that tissue specific stem cells and RB. Were there any literatures on tissue specific transcription factors and RB?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 23187

Title: Retinoblastoma tumor suppressor functions shared by stem cell and cancer cell strategies

Reviewer's code: 00203715

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-11-03 15:29

Date reviewed: 2015-11-24 00:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Kohno et al. "RB tumor suppressor functions shared by stem cell and cancer cell strategies" summarizes the impact of retinoblastoma 1 on the maintenance of stem cells and the direction of their differentiation. The authors compare RB1 function to its role in induced pluripotency, transformation, and cancer cells. Kohno et al. cite a wealth of publications to stress the concept that besides the well-known function RB1 in repression of the cell cycle the protein is also involved in regulation of plasticity and chromosomal stability. They describe examples from plants to mammalian embryonic stem cells and diverse cancer types. The review is up to date but often description and suggested concepts could be more precise throughout the manuscript. An example is the first sentence of the abstract.