

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3213

Title: A meta-analysis of the relationship between apolipoprotein E gene polymorphism with total cholesterol level in patients with renal diseases

Reviewer code: 02451451

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-04-15 09:43

Date reviewed: 2013-05-02 14:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript review-ESPS Manuscript NO: 3213 Title: A meta-analysis of the relationship between apolipoprotein E gene polymorphism with total cholesterol level in patients with renal diseases Drs Zhou, et al. performed a meta-analysis to investigate the relationship between apolipoprotein E (apoE) gene polymorphism and total cholesterol (TC) level in patients with renal diseases. According to their predefined selection criteria, 22 studies were included in the meta-analysis, and patients with different apoE gene polymorphism were compared for the TC level. The authors concluded that apoE gene polymorphism was related to the TC level, but more studies are warranted. The paper is interesting, but several issues needs to be addressed. 1. The academic English writing should be urgently improved, or should be under a native English writing editing. 2. The paper pages should be numbered. 3. Abstract: the Aim of this study should be more concise; however, the Method should be relatively detailed, including the database you searched, inclusion criteria, etc.; in the Results section, the pooled mean difference, and P value should be list. Based on the meta-analysis, could the authors obtain a more specific Conclusion? 4. The Introduction section, the molecular and potentially clinical role of apoE polymorphism was introduced, and the purpose of this meta-analysis was presented. 5. Material and Method section, the inclusion criteria should include Study type, Patients of interest, Comparisons, and Outcomes (Observation variables) 6. Results section: a flow diagram of studies selection should be added, a methodological quality assessment of included studies should be presented. 7. Please add a table listing the detailed characteristics of each included study. 8. It is mentioned that "Our study first reported the association of apoE gene polymorphism with TC level in patients with renal diseases, and showed that apoE gene



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

polymorphism was associated with the expression of TC in patients with renal diseases”, be careful when using the words like “first report”, I mean I may agree that the paper is the first meta-analysis to investigate the role of apoE in patients with renal disease, but may not the first study to report the association of apoE gene polymorphism with TC level, besides, the conclusion of this meta-analysis is not a specific one. I would like to thank the Editor of W-J-Meta for giving the great opportunity to review the manuscript.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3213

Title: A meta-analysis of the relationship between apolipoprotein E gene polymorphism with total cholesterol level in patients with renal diseases

Reviewer code: 00503292

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-04-15 09:43

Date reviewed: 2013-05-21 18:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Find the attachment.