

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Surgical Procedures

ESPS manuscript NO: 14286

Title: Laparoscopic hepatectomy for the treatment of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 02444760

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-09-28 08:11

Date reviewed: 2014-11-08 05:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review of 'Laparoscopic hepatectomy for the treatment of hepatocellular carcinoma' discusses the application of laparoscopic hepatectomy in hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) treatment, and then compares it with traditional operation, namely open liver resection (OLR). According to the summarization, favorable short-term effects, including fewer incidences of ascites and liver failure, and shorter postoperative hospital stays, feature the laparoscopic procedure. Moreover, the reduction of post-operative adhesion, good vision and manipulation within the small area make this procedure safer and more accessible in the context of repeat hepatectomy. These findings are quite interesting, and will likely be valuable to the surgical therapy of HCC. Major comments 1. This review has demonstrated, as shown in Table 1, the safety, feasibility, and short-term benefits of laparoscopic hepatectomy. However, is the long-term effect of laparoscopic hepatectomy still promising? It will be appreciated for the authors to compare the difference in HCC patients with laparoscopic hepatectomy or OLR during a long period of time. 2. Another doubt to the reviewer lies in the selective bias of HCC patients. Is there any difference in the Child-Pugh degree between HCC patients treated by laparoscopic hepatectomy and traditional procedure? Table or table concerning this problem is suggested. Minor comments 1. Table 2, which compares the advantages and disadvantages of laparoscopic liver resection (LLR), should be displayed in the three-line format. In addition, there is similar problem in the Table 1.