ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 29150
Title: Phase angle obtained by bioelectrical impedance analysis independently predicts mortality in patients with cirrhosis
Reviewer's code: 00039097
Reviewer's country: China
Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong
Date sent for review: 2016-08-02 08:12
Date reviewed: 2016-08-06 19:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors aim to explore the potential value of PA in cirrhosis. In general, the topic is interesting, and the design is sound. However, several comments are still need to be addressed. Major comments: 1. Why choose only the male patients? Not female? Are there any differences in gender? 2. The authors concluded that PA may be a useful and reliable bedside tool for prognosis prediciton, however, it is just one non-validated variable not prediction model or system which can greatly increase the prediction abilities. Why not integrated valuable variables to form a model? 3. The authors only use one single-timepoint of PA value. If there is several timepoints of PAs and the changing of PAs may be more useful than the recent one.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 29150
Title: Phase angle obtained by bioelectrical impedance analysis independently predicts mortality in patients with cirrhosis
Reviewer's code: 02860895
Reviewer's country: Japan
Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong
Date sent for review: 2016-08-02 08:12
Date reviewed: 2016-08-28 10:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for
[Y] Grade C: Good	polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	publication
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	language polishing	[Y] No	[ ] Minor revision
	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting report written by Belarmino et al. and showing a clinical significance of the phase angle (PA) as a prognostic indicator in cirrhosis. Nutritional condition is generally recognized to be important in management of cirrhosis patients, and so, the results of this study are quite understandable. The statistical analyses were based on multiple viewpoints, but there is one point to be reconsidered. The multivariate analysis was done to clarify the real predictive potency of PA. Besides PA, age and MELD score were included in this analysis (Table 3). I think that Child-Pugh should be included as a variable because PA correlated to Child-Pugh (Table 1). This is a very critical point of the study.