

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29664

Title: Helicobacter pylori and gastric carcinogenesis in the light of pathogen diversity as well as genetic susceptibility and the profile of the host inflammatory response

Reviewer's code: 03551098

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-25 16:49

Date reviewed: 2016-09-03 12:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1- I recommend changing the title of the manuscript: e.g. Host pathogen interactions in Helicobacter pylori related gastric cancer. 2- It is better to focus on the interruption of signal transduction of host cells by CagA: e.g. Novel effects of Helicobacter pylori CagA on key genes of gastric cancer signal transduction: a comparative transfection study. Pathogen and disease. 12/2014; 73(3). DOI:10.1093/femspd/ftu021. 3- Virulence factors section: It must be summarized. 4- Tables 1 and 2 can be omitted.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29664

Title: Helicobacter pylori and gastric carcinogenesis in the light of pathogen diversity as well as genetic susceptibility and the profile of the host inflammatory response

Reviewer's code: 00000001

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-25 16:49

Date reviewed: 2016-09-04 04:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. There is a very long introductory background section (page 1 -16), followed by sections on H. pylori diversity (page 16-24) and host genetic susceptibility and immune profile (page 24-37). The manuscript could be improved by shortening the length of the introductory section (page 1-16) to remove tangential content. 2. Abstract line 11-13 states: "Due to the specific virulence factors of H. pylori, gastric cancer might have an asymptomatic course." This statement is misleading. Gastric cancer is always asymptomatic in the early stages, but most experts assume that gastric adenocarcinoma always progresses over time to cause symptoms if untreated. 3. Abstract line 13 states, "97% of gastric cancers are malignant". The meaning of this statement is unclear. What type of gastric cancer is not considered malignant? 4. Page 2, paragraph 2 states that "PAI components, toxins, adhesins ... enable these microbes to colonize the stomach for a long period of time". This statement is misleading. For example, strains that lack the PAI routinely colonize the stomach for long periods of time. 5. Page 2, last line states that the bacteria "invade the stomach". H. pylori does not typically invade host cells. 6. Page 3, end of second paragraph, suggests that H.

pylori can colonize the oral cavity. There is very little evidence to support this statement. Recommend that this statement should be deleted. 7. Page 3, last paragraph begins with the question, "What makes this pathogen so dangerous to humans?" This is a misleading statement. Most people colonized with *H. pylori* remain asymptomatic for life. 8. Page 3, last line. Is there really any evidence that OipA acts as an adhesin? The cited references (ref 8-12) do not support this statement. 9. Page 4, first paragraph. Is there really any evidence that Lewis-like antigens in LPS facilitate *H. pylori* adherence to gastric epithelial cells? The cited references (ref 20-22) do not support this statement. 10. Page 4, paragraph 2 describes a correlation between the presence of CagA and a higher risk of inflammation. This statement is misleading. All *H. pylori*-infected people have gastric inflammation. 11. Page 4, last paragraph, states that the PAI includes genes encoding VacA, BabA and SabA. This statement is incorrect. The genes for vacA, babA and sabA are located outside the PAI. 12. Page 5, first line states that VacA causes "elevation of the inflammatory response". The cited reference (ref 29) does not provide any strong evidence to support this statement. 13. Page 5, first line, states that BabA and SabA "promote complement resistance and regulate the immune response of the host". References to support this statement should be provided. 14. Page 5, first paragraph states that SabA recognizes Lewis A antigens. SabA is known to bind sialyl-dimeric-Lewis x (see Mahdavi et al., Science 2002), but is there any evidence that it binds to Lewis A? The cited reference (ref 9) does not provide support for this statement. 15. Pages 7-8 describe the epidemiology of *H. pylori* infection. This is tangential to the main topic of the review article. Recommend that this section should be shortened substantially. 15. Page 9 describes a long list of dermatologic, cardiovascular and pulmonary illnesses. There is relatively little evidence to support the authors' claim that these illnesses are attributable to *H. pylori*. Recommend that this section should be shortened substantially or deleted. 16. Page 11, line 8 states that "97% of gastric cancers are malignant". The meaning of this statement is unclear and no references are cited. What type of gastric cancer is not considered malignant? 17. Page 11 presents a detailed description of the clinical features of gastric cancer and details about staging of this malignancy. Recommend that this section should be shortened substantially. 18. Page 12, paragraph 3 state