

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36134

**Title:** Fecal microbiota transplantation induced remission of infantile allergic colitis through microecology re-establishment

**Reviewer's code:** 02529197

**Reviewer's country:** Poland

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2017-09-05

**Date reviewed:** 2017-09-10

**Review time:** 5 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors of the manuscript - Fecal microbiota transplantation induced remission of infantile allergic colitis through microecology re-establishment - very carefully and clearly show the problem of infantile allergic colitis and FMT treatment. The results of the investigations is very important in practice because the FMT induced remission of infantile allergic colitis and was the safe method for pediatric patients. To this time this method of treatment was already described in other researches, had application to treatment of other illnesses also in pediatric patients (IBD, clostridium difficile). In my opinion, the manuscript is correctly written. I have no remarks to this manuscript.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36134

**Title:** Fecal microbiota transplantation induced remission of infantile allergic colitis through microecology re-establishment

**Reviewer's code:** 02439990

**Reviewer's country:** France

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2017-09-05

**Date reviewed:** 2017-09-14

**Review time:** 8 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors examined the effect of fecal microbiota transplantation (FMT) on the clinical improvement of infants suffering from allergic colitis and on gut microbiota composition. This is a pioneer study which showed clinical improvement in most children and also changes in gut microbiota consistent with decreased gut inflammation. Nevertheless, the study raised several concerns. 1- In a general way, the writing is not clear and English revision is necessary 2- Abstract section "results": the first sentence is not clear. Please only mention the number of infants with complete follow-up. 3- page 7, lines 6-7: what do the authors mean by "unique human genetics"? 4- Page 10, "FMT procedure": Please define NS (3ml NS/mg stool). 5- Page 13, lines 19-21: The sentence should be included in the section "materials and methods" but not in the discussion. 6- Discussion: different points need to be discussed: -did the three patients with decreased GM diversity after

FMT show the same improvement than the patients increased diversity?. -the reasons why FMT was carried out using both stools from infants and adults. Is there any impact on the clinical results?. -the efficacy of the technique needs to be discussed as FMT has to be repeated up to 5 times in children with AC. 7- Conclusion: the authors claimed that this study “extended our understanding of microbiota changes and their roles in immune regulation”. This is not true as no mechanism was examined in the manuscript. 8- Fig 2: the collection date is not clearly shown so that it is difficult to discriminate between pre- and post FMT data. ID can be removed.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36134

**Title:** Fecal microbiota transplantation induced remission of infantile allergic colitis through microecology re-establishment

**Reviewer's code:** 00503545

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2017-09-05

**Date reviewed:** 2017-09-19

**Review time:** 13 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors investigated the therapeutic effects and safety of fecal microbiota transplantation (FMT) treatment on 19 allergic colitis (AC) infants and showed the curative effects of FMT to AC infants. The paper is well written and the results of the study are interesting. However, the authors should address the following point. Allergic colitis shows overlap with classical inflammatory bowel disease (IBD). Thus, it is very important in this study whether the 19 patients were correctly diagnosed as AC. In this context, histological findings of the colonic lesion are key points to distinguish AC from IBD. Thus, the authors should show that the histological findings of the colonic lesions in 19 patients enrolled in this study were compatible with AC.