



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 36576

Title: Probiotic monotherapy and *Helicobacter pylori* eradication: A systematic review with pooled-data analysis

Reviewer's code: 00503623

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-09

Date reviewed: 2017-10-09

Review time: 10 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript presents the literature review of the effectiveness of probiotic mono-therapy on Hp eradication. Based on the data collected from eleven studies, the conclusion is that probiotic-induced reduction rate in Hp eradication varied from 12 to 16%, depending upon the probiotic used. Although the data include the relatively low number of studies, it is apparent that modulation of gastric microbiota by the use of probiotics exerts only limited effect on Hp eradication. The paper is well presented and written in relatively clear language. There are only some minor problems with sentence construction (i.e., Despite several evidences in literature have demonstrated...).



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 36576

Title: Probiotic monotherapy and *Helicobacter pylori* eradication: A systematic review with pooled-data analysis

Reviewer's code: 02840182

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-09

Date reviewed: 2017-10-13

Review time: 4 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors performed a systematic review to define probiotic monotherapy effect on H. pylori status. We already know that probiotics alone do not significantly improve the H.pylori eradication rates. Authors evaluated eleven studies. The specified eradication rate is 12% to 16% according to the kinds of probiotics. It is a well written manuscript. I believe that it will make a good contribution to the literature for the effect of probiotics alone on the eradication rates of H.pylori.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 36576

Title: Probiotic monotherapy and *Helicobacter pylori* eradication: A systematic review with pooled-data analysis

Reviewer's code: 00052339

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-09

Date reviewed: 2017-10-18

Review time: 8 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

PROBIOTIC MONOTHERAPY AND HELICOBACTER PYLORI ERADICATION: A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW WITH POOLED-DATA ANALYSIS Giuseppe Losurdo et al This manuscript showed the meta-analysis on the utility of probiotics for eradication of HP. The probiotics may be very useful for children with HP infection. The paper adopted for this analysis is so different, especially on species of probiotics, duration of treatment and time of determination of HP negative. Hence, it is very difficult to obtain the conclusion about the effects of probiotics on HP eradication from these paper. #1 The determination of HP negative after eradication of HP should be performed longer than 8 weeks after finishing the medication such as penicillin, macrolide and proton pump inhibitor. In this paper, the time on determination of HP negative was different from just one day to 8 weeks after finishing the treatment. Thus, the efficacy of probiotics for HP eradication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

could not be determined. #2 The duration of taking probiotics was also different from 10 days to 12 months. It is so difficult compare the results from these paper. To obtain the conclusion, the author should fix the duration of taking probiotics and the time for HP negative after finishing the treatment at least.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 36576

Title: Probiotic monotherapy and *Helicobacter pylori* eradication: A systematic review with pooled-data analysis

Reviewer's code: 02444931

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-09

Date reviewed: 2017-10-21

Review time: 11 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1、 The effects of probiotic monotherapy on H.pylori eradication were studied in this paper which evaluating on treatments of only three species of probiotics including Lactobacillus, Bifidobacterium and Saccharomyces in the 11 articles . It may be more completed when adding other more probiotics such us Gram-positive cocci including Streptococcus faecalis and Lactococcus. 2、 The search term ([*Helicobacter pylori*] AND [probiotic* OR lactobacilli OR bifidobacteria OR saccharomyces OR treatment OR eradication OR breath test]) may not be comprehensive enough which taking on only 11 articles that may lead to insufficient results. It will improving the recall rate when adding terms such as Bacillus Acidi Lactici which also expressing Lactobacillus or other acronyms like H.pylori and so on. 3、 The exclusion criteria “used probiotics in combination to antibiotics, while co-administration of other molecules such as proton



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

pump inhibitors was not considered as an exclusion criterion” can also include more factors such as the combination of surgical and other treatment methods to make the study more targeted and rigorous. 4、 The factors taken into account when extracting data information may not be comprehensive enough. In Table 1 for instance, factors such as smoking and drinking that affect H.pylori eradication could be added , and further subgroup analysis could be in progress. 5、The content of Table1 may not be good overall because of the difference from sample sizes of each disparate articles taken on, which may result in a greater bias since it weighted. Statistics could be more accuracy to add a "sample size" column for each article. 6、 There is a comparisons between subgroups since Figure 2, but the previous heterogeneity analysis might be not convincing that there are no specific statistical results or graphs that can be supplemented on the analysis of heterogeneity. 7、All the figures drawing from chart statistics are only Forest plots, which can be added to commonly used Funnel plots and other types of charts to make the results look more abundant. 8、 Some parts of the reference format are not uniform. 9、 English expression may not be appropriate. 1)、 The use of multiple Conjunctions in the full text may be inappropriate. Such that “multistrain” could be amended to “multi-strain” , “multicentre” could be amended to “multi-centre”. 2)、 Grammatical errors and Single and plural usage errors. For example, the last sentence of paragraph 5 in Page 4 “For these reason, it is hypothesizable that probiotics may exert a direct inhibitory effect on H. pylori growth. ”should be changed to "For these reasons, it is hypothesized that ..." 3)、 Inappropriate use of prepositions. For example, ①multiple “effects in” could be amended to “effect on” in the whole paper. ②The last sentence of the first paragraphe in Page 4 “Until now, meta-analyses have investigated probiotic effects on H. pylori only in association to antibiotics.” could be changed to”..... in association with.....” ③The last sentence of the paragraphe 3 in Page 5 “A third reviewer (GLE) came to a decision about any disagreements.” could be amended to ”.....decision on.....” ④ multiple “ details about ” could be changed to “details of” in the whole test. .