

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6515

Title: Cytokinome profile evaluation as predictive tool of disease progression in patients with hepatitis C virus infection

Reviewer code: 00003250

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-22 18:54

Date reviewed: 2013-12-09 17:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors described the comprehensive evaluation of cytokinome profile in patients with various stages of chronic hepatitis C virus infection. This paper seems informative but has some concerns to be addressed. First, some abbreviations are difficult to understand. For example, LC in Table 1, 2, and 3 means cirrhosis with HCV infection? In Table 2, LCD means cirrhosis with HCV infection and type 2 diabetes? Second, Figure 2 is completely the same as Figure 1 in Ref. 27. The source of Figure 2 should be indicated in the text or in figure legends.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6515

Title: Cytokinome profile evaluation as predictive tool of disease progression in patients with hepatitis C virus infection

Reviewer code: 00004603

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-22 18:54

Date reviewed: 2013-12-19 07:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this ms, authors try to analyse the role of cytokinomics in development of LC, LCD and HCC. However, there are several important questions to the authors: 1. It is not clear whether LC, LCD and HCC are HCV outcomes. If not, there is no sense to compare any "omics" of HCV patients with chronic hepatitis, LC, LCD and HCC and patients of other etiological groups. 2. If you consider some cytokines to be important for differential diagnostics between different stages of liver injury, then use appropriate statistical approaches to show which levels of these cytokines have diagnostic meaning and which patients belong to the risk groups. 3. There is no great sense in showing the difference in cytokine levels between control and groups of patients, especially if you use multi-etiological groups. 4. In Fig2, there significant differences between parameters in various groups are not indicated 5. It is pretty much clear now, that the functional role of cytokines depends those signal transduction pathways which they are able to activate and those liver cells that have receptors to these cytokines and thereby can transduce the signals. This point should be elaborated rather than demonstration of Fig.3, which is in a way it is presented, makes no sense.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6515

Title: Cytokine profile evaluation as predictive tool of disease progression in patients with hepatitis C virus infection

Reviewer code: 00058444

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-22 18:54

Date reviewed: 2013-12-26 15:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors reviewed the role of the cytokines in chronic hepatitis C virus (HCV) infection, HCV-related cirrhosis (both in presence and absence of type 2 diabetes), and HCV-related hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). They conclude that some interleukins and chemokines are putative markers of the progression of HCV leading to liver cirrhosis by increasing fibrosis, and might be used as templates for designing new drugs to block the progression of the inflammatory processes. This topic is very important to understand the pathogenesis of HCV related chronic liver disease, liver cirrhosis, and hepatocellular carcinoma. The preparation of this review manuscript is good. Although there is still a long way to use cytokine for designing new drugs to block the progression of inflammatory processes, this manuscript provides a new direction to study the HCV related diseases.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6515

Title: Cytokine profile evaluation as predictive tool of disease progression in patients with hepatitis C virus infection

Reviewer code: 00227366

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-22 18:54

Date reviewed: 2013-12-30 19:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, entitled "Cytokine profile evaluation as predictive tool of disease progression in patients with hepatitis C virus infection", some results of the studies that were performed on level comparison of cytokines in patients with chronic hepatitis C virus (HCV) or with HCV-related cirrhosis, and in patients with HCV-related cirrhosis in presence and in absence of type 2 diabetes, and in patients with HCV-related cirrhosis in presence and in absence of hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). Most of the studies that were reviewed in the paper belong to the group's previous studies and results were discussed successfully comparing with the studies of the other groups. In addition, the role of the cytokines in chronic inflammatory diseases and cancers, the significance of the cytokine profile and the liver cirrhosis as example of inflammatory diseases were given clearly. Therefore this review seems helpful to understand the totality of cytokines and their potentials as putative markers of the progression of HCV leading to LC. The English of the manuscript is clear. This manuscript is acceptable with some minor mistakes. Information of the numbers of the patients should be given for each study that was given in this paper, which is critical in such studies. In section 6 entitled "Cytokines evaluation in LC patients in presence and/or absence of HCC" a reference should be indicated after the first sentence, in which the results of a study were given. In this document there is neither a running title nor key words. In addition pages were not numbered.