

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 15189

Title: Fetal kidney stem cells ameliorate cisplatin induced acute renal failure in rats and accelerate angiogenesis in injured kidney

Reviewer's code: 02446337

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-11-13 19:22

Date reviewed: 2014-12-06 03:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Characterization of Endothelial cells is poor. The Authors should provide some data on migration (J Clin Invest, 2014;124:4102-4114) Blood pressure of the animals should be provided. Indeed, endothelial dysfunction, hypertension and kidney damage are strictly related (J Am Heart Assoc. 2012 Aug;1(4):e001081). The role of hypertension in determining the risk of coronary artery disease (Coronary heart disease risk factors and mortality. JAMA. 2012 Mar 21;307(11):1137 - PMID: 22436947) should be mentioned. Fig. 8A: the molecular markers on the gel should be shown. At least two lines per sample should be provided. The study limitations should be extensively addressed. The conclusions should be toned down. Language needs some polishing for better flow.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 15189

Title: Fetal kidney stem cells ameliorate cisplatin induced acute renal failure in rats and accelerate angiogenesis in injured kidney

Reviewer's code: 00631959

Reviewer's country: France

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-11-13 19:22

Date reviewed: 2014-12-22 23:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Gupta et al. show that fetal kidney stem cells accelerate angiogenesis in the kidney and ameliorate ARF in rats. The data are in general convincing and the manuscript is clearly written. Language and grammar corrections are required (see minor comments). Major comments: As Pax2 overexpression has been shown to reduce WT1, why the fKSC cells express both markers highly? This should be discussed. HIF-1 does not only activate VEGF, but also WT1. In Western Blots, is there a difference in Wt1 expression? Do the fKSC express nephrin or nestin, which are two important Wt1-dependent molecules in the kidney? As Wt1 has been described recently as important regulator of angiogenesis (Wagner et al., Nat Commun. 2014 Dec 16;5:5852), do the Wt1 expressing fKSC contribute directly to the neo-angiogenesis? All the above mentioned papers should be cited. Minor comments: The short title is not really short. Page 7: Retinoic acid Page 7: the animals were given Page 8: "All animals were euthanized by barbiturate overdose (intravenous injection, 150 mg/kg pentobarbital sodium) before fKSC administration on day 0 and after fKSC administration on days 3 and 7." needs clarification. Page 9: room temperature Page 10: horseradish Page 12: TUNEL Page 13 and 14: renal



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

function Page 15: by VEGF instead of these VEGF Figure 4 legend: Scale bars indicate 20 μ m. Figure 4:
Please point to the signs of kidney damage with different types of arrows and explain in the legend.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 15189

Title: Fetal kidney stem cells ameliorate cisplatin induced acute renal failure in rats and accelerate angiogenesis in injured kidney

Reviewer's code: 00503175

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-11-13 19:22

Date reviewed: 2014-12-20 13:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Article "Fetal kidney stem cells ameliorate cisplatin induced acute renal failure in rats and accelerate angiogenesis in injured kidney" by Ashwani Kumar Gupta et al. is according to my opinion, acceptable for publication. It is a very interesting article about a possible protective role of fetal kidney stem cells in experimental model of acute renal failure.