



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54339

Title: Timing of surgery after neoadjuvant chemoradiotherapy affects oncologic outcomes in patients with esophageal cancer

Reviewer's code: 03017516

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Senior Postdoctoral Fellow, Surgeon, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: France

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-23 05:58

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-30 18:16

Review time: 7 Days and 12 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
-----------------------	------------------	------------	-----------	-----------------------------



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
				<input type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:
				<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
				<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please clearly define longer and shorter waiting periods in the Methods. Results: did you compare preoperative patients' characteristics of the two groups? Were the 2 groups comparable for baseline variables? A prolonged interval resulted in worse OS in the overall group and in SCC patients, whereas patients with AC had better survival with longer interval, may you better discuss this finding? It is related to different radiosensitivity? How does this observation affect clinical practice? May you include quality assessment of the included studies? This meta-analysis has several potential bias, due to the methodological quality of the included studies (no randomized trials). Do you feel that your conclusion may modify the clinical management of these patients?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54339

Title: Timing of surgery after neoadjuvant chemoradiotherapy affects oncologic outcomes in patients with esophageal cancer

Reviewer's code: 03552525

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-02-27 01:32

Reviewer performed review: 2020-02-27 02:17

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good				<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:

[] Yes

[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Timing of surgery after neoadjuvant therapy is very important topic in treatment for esophageal cancer, but there are some points to revise. 1. Indeed, there were many evidence about nCRT following surgery. However, many of these article was from Western countries, where there were many patients with adenocarcinoma. So, authors should consider about this heterogeneity when thinking about this theme. 2. The title is neoadjuvant therapy, but authors talked about only nCRT in this article. So, authors should revise title of this article. 3. Authors said that "Pooled data from the two studies demonstrated that a prolonged time interval was significantly associated with better OS with a HR estimate of 1.385 (95% CI: 1.186-1.616, $P < 0.001$; Table 2)" in results section. I think worse OS, but not better OS, as you said that "In addition, a longer wait time indicated worse OS (HR: 1.385, 95%CI: 1.186-1.616, $P < 0.001$) in patients with AC." in abstract section. 4. It is important result that longer wait time correlate worse OS, but articles were not randomized control studies about time interval between nCRT and surgery. Do you think about probability of existence of poorer factors in longer wait time patients? 5. In this theme, authors should also consider about total treatment time of nCRT because some patients interrupt treatment. 6. Authors said that "Esophagectomy should not be performed beyond 8 weeks after nCRT in view of OS, especially in patients with good recovery and response to nCRT.". This article suggests that longer



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

wait time correlate worse OS, but cannot indicate concrete best interval time. So, why do you think that esophagectomy should not be performed beyond 8 weeks after nCRT in view of OS?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54339

Title: Timing of surgery after neoadjuvant chemoradiotherapy affects oncologic outcomes in patients with esophageal cancer

Reviewer's code: 03317348

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-02-26 12:29

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-01 14:22

Review time: 4 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good				<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I think that this paper is interesting for the esophageal surgeons, gastroenterologists, radiation oncologists, and medical oncologists. In order to better this manuscript, I have the following minor comments. 1. Do the authors misunderstand “Running Head” in TITLE PAGE ? Please change to, for example, “Timing of esophagectomy after neoadjuvant chemoradiotherapy”. 2. Is “Pooled data from ...” (Page 9, Line 15-18) miswritten ? Is not “better” but “worse” correct? 3. Please provide figure legends especially figure 4 and 5 for wider readers. In addition, please add what staging method is used (e.g.8th UICC classification) to Table 1. 4. Could the authors provide the information of the method of esophagectomy?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54339

Title: Timing of surgery after neoadjuvant chemoradiotherapy affects oncologic outcomes in patients with esophageal cancer

Reviewer's code: 03317348

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-14 07:05

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-14 07:37

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I think the authors have responded almost exactly to the request of reviewers (reviewer 3).

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54339

Title: Timing of surgery after neoadjuvant chemoradiotherapy affects oncologic outcomes in patients with esophageal cancer

Reviewer's code: 03017516

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Senior Postdoctoral Fellow, Surgeon, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: France

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-14 08:17

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-14 08:23

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
--------------------	------------------	------------	--------------------------



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish		<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Authors have answered to the reviewers' comments and remarks and comments and the manuscript has been improved. I think that it is now acceptable for publication. Congratulations.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
☐ Duplicate publication
☐ Plagiarism
☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
☐ Duplicate publication
☐ Plagiarism
☒ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com