



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

Manuscript NO: 40801

Title: High-resolution computed tomography findings in humoral primary immunodeficiencies and correlation with pulmonary function tests

Reviewer's code: 02669684

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-07-27

Date reviewed: 2018-07-28

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good title too Long introduction, needs shortening Needs more references in the last three years



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- [Y] No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- [Y] No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

Manuscript NO: 40801

Title: High-resolution computed tomography findings in humoral primary immunodeficiencies and correlation with pulmonary function tests

Reviewer’s code: 02673247

Reviewer’s country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-07-27

Date reviewed: 2018-07-28

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled “HRCT findings in adult patients with humoral primary immunodeficiency diseases: prevalence in different subtypes and correlation with pulmonary function tests” is in good shape and is well organized. The experiments were



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

designed to support the hypothesis. The paper is well written. I am very happy to recommend its publication on this journal if the following questions are addressed properly. 1. RESULTS, Study population and PFTs results "There were no statistically significant differences between the two subgroups of hPIDs in terms of prevalence of both obstructive (CVID: 44.7% vs. CVID-like: 42.9%) and restrictive (CVID: 13.1% vs. CVID-like: 0%) defects ($p>0.05$)". Which differences for $p>0.05$? 2. In Fig. 1, Fig.2, Fig.4 and Fig.5, no arrow indicated lesions.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

Manuscript NO: 40801

Title: High-resolution computed tomography findings in humoral primary immunodeficiencies and correlation with pulmonary function tests

Reviewer’s code: 00225366

Reviewer’s country: Canada

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-07-27

Date reviewed: 2018-07-30

Review time: 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This work performed a retrospective study on humoral primary immunodeficiency disease using HRCT. Although the result may help the readers improving their inspection skill on finding the disease in the future, this work does not have



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

comparisons with other imaging and test results. It is very rare to justify the humoral primary immunodeficiency disease by only using one imaging method. So, the authors should provide more information how this study can combine with other tests and imaging results in order to improve the whole outcome.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- [Y] No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- [Y] No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

Manuscript NO: 40801

Title: High-resolution computed tomography findings in humoral primary immunodeficiencies and correlation with pulmonary function tests

Reviewer's code: 02577402

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-07-27

Date reviewed: 2018-08-05

Review time: 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this MS, the authors studied HRCT findings in adult patients with humoral primary immunodeficiency diseases: prevalence in different subtypes and correlation with pulmonary function tests. It is well-written paper. But there are also a few grammar and



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

punctuation mistakes. For example: In the second paragraph in the Introduction, “allows prompt treatment aimed to reduce-----” should be “allows prompt treatment to reduce----”. In the first paragraph in the DISCUSSION section, “make difficult to generalize this-----” should be “make it difficult to generalize this----”. In the fourth paragraph in DISCUSSION, “Two on 10 cases” should be “Two of 10 cases”. Please check the whole article and correct all grammar mistakes. In the figures and tables, please give the full phrases of all the abbreviations. In Table 2, please give the significance between two groups for comparison.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

Manuscript NO: 40801

Title: High-resolution computed tomography findings in humoral primary immunodeficiencies and correlation with pulmonary function tests

Reviewer’s code: 03501976

Reviewer’s country: Spain

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-07-17

Date reviewed: 2018-08-06

Review time: 20 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

First: the authors do not find significant difference in the prevalence of the majority of High-resolution Computed Tomography (HRCT) findings or Pulmonary function tests (PFTs) abnormalities between Common variable immunodeficiency disorders (CVID)



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

and CVID-like conditions, supporting the hypothesis that they are comparable Humoral primary immunodeficiency diseases (hPIDs) subtypes, and candidate to similar management. Tree-in-bud and linear and/or irregular opacities in HRCT were found to be independent predictors of obstructive and restrictive defects on PFTs, respectively. Second: The authors suggest suggesting that patients showing these findings might benefit from more frequent HRCT during the follow-up, to evaluate morphological abnormalities underlying impaired function. Third: The main limitation pointed out by the authors is the retrospective nature of the study. It is not clear that it was done first if the HCRT or the PFTs, how long it was between the two tests and thus establish an association, which can be interfered with by unexpected clinical situations, such as lung infection or any other type of lung disease of new appearance in time. The authors should propose a prospective study before indicating repetition HCRT in these patients given the radiation risk. The independent variables in the multivariate analysis should be expressed as OR and CI of 95%

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No