

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24917

Title: MicroRNA-548a-5p improves proliferation and inhibits apoptosis in hepatocellular carcinoma cells (HCC) by targeting Tg737

Reviewer's code: 02861131

Reviewer's country: Moldova

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-02-15 16:16

Date reviewed: 2016-03-01 05:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript Number: 24917 Manuscript Title: MICRORNA-548A-5P IMPROVES PROLIFERATION AND INHIBITS APOPTOSIS IN HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA CELLS (HCC) BY TARGETING TG737 Comments To Authors GENERAL COMMENTS (1) The importance of the research and the significance of the research contents; The authors of this article have been evaluated the interrelation between Tg737 and microRNA-548a-5p (miR-548a-5p), and how this relation correlates with hepatocellular carcinoma cells (HCC) proliferation and apoptosis. The authors suggest "...miR-548a-5p negatively regulates tumor inhibitor gene Tg737 and promotes tumorigenesis progress in vitro and in vivo, indicating its potential as a novel therapeutic target for HCC. ..." The importance and significant of the research contents is high, because this article present the new therapeutic strategies which may be useful to limit HCC growing and metastasis (inhibition of miR-548a-5p). (2) The novelty and innovation of the research; Zhao Ge et al. present the evidence that "... miR-548a-5p negatively regulates tumor inhibitor gene Tg737 and promotes tumorigenesis progress in vitro and in vivo..." . The novelty of the research represents the idea that

inhibition of miR-548a-5p may limit HCC growth and miR-548a-5p expression may be the potential predictor of tumor that respond to Tg 737 -targeting therapies. (3) Presentation and readability of the manuscript; The original article is well organized and classically presented scientific article, well readable manuscript . (4) Ethics of the research. All animal procedures were performed in accordance with a protocol approved by the Fourth Military Medical University Animal Care and Usage Committee

SPECIFIC COMMENTS Title: accurately reflects the major topic and contents of the study (may not a very good idea to abbreviation in the title). Abstract: it gives a clear delineation of the research background, objectives, methods, results, conclusions and key words. Abstract contain the main point presented in this original article. As summarized, the article highline that novel therapeutic strategies would be the forefront of HCC treatment in the near future. Introduction: present relevant information about primary hepatocellular carcinoma, Tg737 gene as a tumor suppressor gene in multiple cancers, microRNAs (miRNAs) as a group of important endogenous modulators of gene function at the posttranscriptional level and they interrelation, which influence the HCC growing and metastasis. Materials and Methods This part of the article is well organized; contain information which help the riders to understand the methodology of the study, which evaluate interrelation between Tg737 and microRNA-548a-5p in in vitro and in vivo. Contain section with statistical analysis. Results This part of article help the riders to illuminate the role of Tg737 in HCC cell proliferation, to show how miR-548a-5p acted on Tg737, to detect the impacts of miR-548a-5p on HCC cell proliferation and to illustrate that Tg737 is a functional target of miR-548a-5p. All of this information are supported by good quality figures and graphs. Discussion. Zhao Ge et al present the idea that miR-548a-5p negatively regulates tumor inhibitor gene Tg737 and promotes tumorigenesis progress. The author suggests that the inhibition of miR-548a-5p may be new therapeutic strategies to limit tumorigenesis progress. Conclusions The authors had presented valuable conclusion that provide novel evidence that miR-548a-5p negatively regulates tumor inhibitor gene Tg737 and promotes tumorigenesis progress in vitro and in vivo. References: references are appropriate, relevant, and updated. Tables and figures: figures and graphs are relevant and useful

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24917

Title: MicroRNA-548a-5p improves proliferation and inhibits apoptosis in hepatocellular carcinoma cells (HCC) by targeting Tg737

Reviewer's code: 02861012

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-02-15 16:16

Date reviewed: 2016-02-27 05:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have presented an interesting study on the role of miR-548a-5p in HCC and how particularly it can modulate the tumor inhibitor gene Tg737. Specific comments: 1. The authors are unclear how the cell cycle was studied (Materials and Methods paragraph 2.5.3. 2. In Figure 2C the western blot plot of Tg737 after anti-miR-548a-5p blocking shows several bands of different size for Tg737. What are these extra bands and why they don't appear in the other Tg737 blots? The authors need also to state the molecular weight of the bands for Tg737 and b-actin. 3. In Figure 2 the authors show that overexpression of miR-548a-5p reduced by 2-fold the expression Tg737, but when miR-548a-5p was blocked there was 4x more Tg737. What do the authors think about this? Is there anything else involved in regulation of Tg737 mediated by blocking of miR-548a-5p?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24917

Title: MicroRNA-548a-5p improves proliferation and inhibits apoptosis in hepatocellular carcinoma cells (HCC) by targeting Tg737

Reviewer's code: 02861252

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-02-15 16:16

Date reviewed: 2016-02-28 04:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good work

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24917

Title: MicroRNA-548a-5p improves proliferation and inhibits apoptosis in hepatocellular carcinoma cells (HCC) by targeting Tg737

Reviewer's code: 02861333

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-02-15 16:16

Date reviewed: 2016-03-04 23:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. What about the originality of the HCC cell lines, eg, HCC cell lines HepG2 and MHCC97-H?
2. Polish the MS. such as, line 175, "200 cells" should be written as two hundred cells. "2×10⁶ HepG2 cells", line 181, "Kit-8(CCK-8)" should have blank interval.
3. The name of cell line should be consistent, eg, MHCC97-H, and MHCC97H (line 192).
4. Which strain of the nude mice? BALB/c?