BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 16486
Title: Givinostat inhibits proliferation and activation of hepatic stellate cells by regulating acetylation of nuclear factor-KB and superoxide dismutase 2
Reviewer's code: 00061674
Reviewer's country: Egypt
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2015-01-20 23:07
Date reviewed: 2015-02-09 10:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors explored the effect of histone deacetylase (HDAC) inhibitor givinostat in regulating the proliferation of hepatic stellate cells in vitro and its antifibrotic activities in mouse model of CCl4-induced liver fibrosis. This study is important since it investigates the role of the epigenetic drug givinostat, an HDAC inhibitor, in resolution of liver fibrosis. In general, the study is well designed and executed; however, it suffers few shortcomings that need to be addressed. In the Methods section, it is important to quantify the amount of collagen and/or grade of fibrosis in the control and treatment groups in order to statistically verify the presence of significant changes. See for example, PLoS ONE 9(11): e112384. Moreover, the manuscript needs languish polishing and attention to several typos. Examples are mentioned below. In the Methods section, the authors did not describe in details the animal model of liver fibrosis due to incomplete sentence in page 9, line 1. The sentence "four portions of CCl4 and six of…." is incomplete and the duration of the treatment was not stated. Page 4, line 6, the word "imbalanced" should read "imbalance" without "d" Page 4, line 9, the word "avalproic acid" at the beginning of the line should be deleted. It is both incorrect

and redundant. Page 5, 3rd line of last section, in the expression (1 ? 106 cells/well) the exponent is misplaced. In the Results section; page 12, line 7; the word "by givinostat" should be "by CCl4" Page 23, the figure legend "Fig. 5 Pathological changes of liver tissue in mouse models of liver fibrosis induced by givinostat treatment" should read "Fig. 5 Pathological changes of liver tissue in mouse models of liver fibrosis induced by CCl4 treatment" because it is the CCl4 that induced liver fibrosis but givinostat treatment reduces the fibrotic process.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 16486
Title: Givinostat inhibits proliferation and activation of hepatic stellate cells by regulating acetylation of nuclear factor-KB and superoxide dismutase 2
Reviewer's code: 00053441
Reviewer's country: Portugal
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2015-01-20 23:07
Date reviewed: 2015-02-06 23:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the paper by Wang et al the effect of histone deacetylase inhibitor (givinostat) on the proliferation of hepatic stellate cells. The paper is well written and the methods are adequate. Minor comments: The authors should avoid using acronyms in the abstract, if they are not repeated. For instance HDAC. Other acronyms are not disclosed (e.g.,ROS). Please review this. Introduction: Line 21, page 3. Hepatic sinusoid capilarization occurs without activation of HSC. It occurs with aging, without proliferation or myofibroblastic transformation of HSC. Please delete this. Materials and methods Line 10, page 9. Collagen fibers accumulate but they do not proliferate. Please change "proliferation of collagen" to collagen deposition. It is not needed to state which are the colours of the Masson's Trichrome. The authors could have quantified in the control, CCl4 and givinostat model. This would increase the value of the manuscript. Figures Figure 5 The images should be reviewed. The images at 40x do not have good quality (bubbles in two images) and should be changed. The Legend should be reviewed (Hyperplasia does not apply to collagen).