

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 21351

**Title:** Gastric cancer: Current status of lymph node dissection

**Reviewer's code:** 00012156

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2015-07-08 14:49

**Date reviewed:** 2015-07-22 11:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Review of the manuscripts, "Gastric Cancer: current status of lymph node dissection. A review article." by M. Degiuli, et al. This review article describes the current status of lymphadenectomy in gastric cancer surgery. In the past, significance of D2 lymphadenectomy for gastric cancer were denied in the Western countries by the results of two large scale multicenter RCTs in '90s. Nowadays D2 lymphadenectomy is recommended as a standard procedure for advanced gastric cancer in worldwide countries, since a trend of improved survival among D2 patients was recorded and to the increase of skilled and experience on D2 technique decreasing surgical mortality. Major points #1. The authors explained the Japanese classification of gastric carcinoma precisely according to 2nd English edition published in 1998. It is expired since 3rd English edition published in 2011. Third English edition includes great revision especially in the classification of lymph node metastasis. Lymph node stage is no longer differ from TNM staging, so the authors should rewrite the following parts; page 6, line4-13, Table2, Table3. #2. The authors also described the "definitions of different levels of lymph node dissection (page 10)" along to the old English version of Japanese gastric cancer treatment guidelines published in 2004. Modified surgery is now classified to "D1+", and is not



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

already classified as "D1+alfa" or "D1+beta" . So this part also should be rewrite correctly along to the 3rd English edition of Japanese gastric cancer treatment guidelines published in 2010. Minor points #1. One hundred and forty papers were cited in the manuscript, however the reference lists showed 118 references only. The author should provide correct reference lists. #2. Page 9, line 10; from " jejunal veins" to "middle colic vein" #3. Page 9, line 23; from "thid tier" to " third tier" #4. Page 9, line26; from "theleft" to " the left" #5. Page 22, line28; from "RTCs" to "RCTs" #6. Page 26, line25; from "Nr" to "No." #7. Page 26, line27; from "nr" to "No."