

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hematology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4977

Title: BLOOD GROUPS, HEMOGLOBIN PHENOTYPES AND CLINICAL DISORDERS OF A CONSANGUINEOUS POPULATION: THE CASE OF THE YANSI TRIBE

Reviewer code: 00506058

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-08-07 19:44

Date reviewed: 2013-08-17 01:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Reviewer report on the manuscript entitled: "blood groups, hemoglobin phenotypes and clinical disorders of a consanguineous population: the case of the YANSI tribe". The study aimed to determine the frequency of blood groups antigens in the ABO, Rh and other systems as well as the prevalence of sickle-cell anemia's trait and the glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficiency among the consanguineous Yansi tribe in the Democratic Republic of the Congo. The study revealed a significant difference in MNS blood group distribution between the Yansi tribe and a control population. Thus new data has been provided that consanguinity brings genetic disorders in the population. The study is well written and can be accepted for publication.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hematology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4977

Title: BLOOD GROUPS, HEMOGLOBIN PHENOTYPES AND CLINICAL DISORDERS OF A CONSANGUINEOUS POPULATION: THE CASE OF THE YANSI TRIBE

Reviewer code: 02512574

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-08-07 19:44

Date reviewed: 2013-08-29 01:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is interesting and timely. I have however a few comments for them: 1. Please provide more information on the controls: Were they of the same race, same region, same country etc.? 2. The G6PD deficiency statistics should be given separately for men and for women. 3. The blood grouping and extended phenotyping procedures' methods are inadequate and unreferenced. What technique was used to determine the antigen antibody reaction? Which manufacturer's antibodies were used? 4. For G6PD deficiency the SpotTest technique was used, which appears to be a tradename of a particular kit. However, the reference 21. points to a 1968 article. Please provide at least minimal information about the kit you used, including its sensitivity, principle etc. 5. Of the disorders studied, were any correlations observed between sickle cell trait (AS) and thrombotic diseases, epilepsy, pregnancy losses etc?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hematology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4977

Title: BLOOD GROUPS, HEMOGLOBIN PHENOTYPES AND CLINICAL DISORDERS OF A CONSANGUINEOUS POPULATION: THE CASE OF THE YANSI TRIBE

Reviewer code: 00225291

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-08-07 19:44

Date reviewed: 2013-09-05 22:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is my belief that this manuscript is beyond this journal's scope. Authors should seek a genetics or hematology-related journal. However, I will add some comments to the manuscript. 1.- Text is well written, although some corrections are needed, such as in the first paragraph of the MATERIAL AND METHODS SECTION: "...of the Congo, where live the Yansi people" should be "...of the Congo, where the Yansi people live", and some other minor corrections. 2.- The main result is a difference in the frequency of some blood antigens between both groups. With regard to other comparisons, there are not differences and the paper should then focus mainly on the significance differences. 3.- Authors should provide more data on the control population: is the geographic area of recollection of samples close to the Yansi tribe? This demographic data are relevant. 4.- Authors the end up commenting the "...medical risks associated with consanguineous unions...", but this already known. 5.- Finally, authors stress the relevance of their findings with regard to clinical aspects, but none of the results shown support their conclusions. For instance, the increased abortion rate in the Yansi tribe may well be due to HLA similarity between spouses, as already shown by J. Dausset in other consanguineous tribes some years ago. I do not doubt the clinical problems exist, but with the results shown, it cannot be deduced there is a direct causal link.