

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Surgical Procedures

ESPS manuscript NO: 14293

Title: In utero and ex utero fetal surgery on histogenesis of organs

Reviewer's code: 01350278

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-09-28 12:34

Date reviewed: 2014-12-09 21:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review of fetal surgery on histogenesis of organs in animals, The review is very comprehensive, including in utero and ex utero and covering different animals, an very well written with minimal typo and grammatical errors. Just a few suggestions to highlight the review even higher quality: 1. title: since the review focus on animals only, it is better to include "in animals" at the end. 2. Introduction: page 5, first paragraph, last sentence seems not relevant. No further details was provided in the rest of the review and prevention and treatment of cardiovascular disease and type 2 diabetes are more maternal then fetal. 3. Ex Utero surgery: it only included rodents, how about other aniamls, such as sheep, pig and primates as described in In Utero Surgery. 4. Abdominal Closure and Recovery: it is too short in relative to other sections and also only rodents but not other animals. If not much, consider to combine into the former sections. In addition, how about any figures of survival rates in both mothers and fetus? 5. If possible, a new short section to discuss the prospective and current development of fetal therapy in human.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Surgical Procedures

ESPS manuscript NO: 14293

Title: In utero and exo utero fetal surgery on histogenesis of organs

Reviewer's code: 00039015

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-09-28 12:34

Date reviewed: 2014-11-03 00:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1,This review described the rationale for in utero and exo utero surgical manipulation of animal models of different kinds of organ defects or anomalies and their repairment based on the analyses of histogenesis of organs and pathologic observations. The manuscript represented an interesting for readers in this scope. 2,Many contents of this review were similar with previous published paper(Ng?-Muller V, Muneoka K. In utero and exo utero surgery on rodent embryos. Methods Enzymol. 2010;476:205-26), which should be shorten. 3,In this manuscript it was described that intrauterine embryo injections can be successfully carried out on mouse embryo stages as early as E9.5. However, in a recent published paper showed intrauterine injection could be performed as early as E8(1,Endo M1, Zoltick PW, Chung DC, Bennett J, Radu A, Muvarak N, Flake AW. Gene transfer to ocular stem cells by early gestational intraamniotic injection of lentiviral vector. Mol Ther. 2007 Mar;15(3):579-87. 2, Endo M1, Zoltick PW, Radu A, Jiang Q, Matsui C, Marinkovich PM, McGrath J, Tamai K, Uitto J, Flake AW. Early intra-amniotic gene transfer using lentiviral vector improves skin blistering phenotype in a murine model of Herlitz junctional epidermolysis bullosa. Gene Ther. 2012 May;19(5):561-9.).Therefore it is necessary to add many recent published papers in



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

this manuscript.