

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12915

Title: Ovarian stem cells: From basic to clinical applications

Reviewer's code: 02445985

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-07-29 22:58

Date reviewed: 2014-10-15 01:30

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript appropriately describes the current state of the field with respect to the ovarian stem cell controversy. The manuscript, however, needs much editing and other items which I have annotated on my comments in Track Changes to the authors' manuscript. Some Table references are incorrect, as are some citations in the body of the text. Transitions between paragraphs are needed as stated in the annotated copy.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12915

Title: Ovarian stem cells: From basic to clinical applications

Reviewer's code: 02446215

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-07-29 22:58

Date reviewed: 2014-10-20 19:27

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | [Y] No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is interesting even if there are early papers that already talked about ovarian germline stem cells and the role of these cells in ovarian cancer. In this review, there is no information on the epigenetic role in transformed ovarian stem cells and critical comments to studies mentioned are lacking. In addition, the authors should add the following papers to bolster the discussion further. Role of mesenchymal cells in the natural history of ovarian cancer: a review. Touboul C, Vidal F, Pasquier J, Lis R, Rafii A. J Transl Med. 2014 Oct 11;12(1):271.. Reinterpretation of evidence advanced for neo-oogenesis in mammals, in terms of a finite oocyte reserve. Notarianni E J Ovarian Res. 2011 Jan 6;4(1):1. In vitro and in vivo germ line potential of stem cells derived from newborn mouse skin. Dyce PW, Liu J, Tayade C, Kidder GM, Betts DH, Li J PLoS One. 2011;6(5):e20339 Epigenetic status determines germ cell meiotic commitment in embryonic and postnatal mammalian gonads. Wang N, Tilly JL. Cell Cycle. 2010 Jan 15;9(2):339-49.