



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 1569

Title: Analysis of single nucleotide polymorphisms in the region of CLDN2 - MORC4 in relation to inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer code: 00013033

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2012-12-23 19:03

Date reviewed: 2012-12-27 16:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a small study on the importance of claudins (CLDN1, 2 and 4) in Swedish and non-Swedish case-control and family-based approach. A weak suggestive association was reported in the case-control setting, while this was not replicated in the non-Swedish sample. Comments; 1. The power of the case control approach is barely sufficient for the investigation of an OR of around 2, but definitely this is underpowered for an OR around 1.5. Thus even there a confirmatory Swedish cohort would be needed. 2. The association could not be replicated in the non-Swedish sample (European though), thus even if there is a suggestive association this is restricted to the Nordic countries. IN any case GWAS studies (Jostins L Nature 2012) did not report this SNP-SNOs, this should be included in the introduction-discussion and authors should provide an explanation of the rational of the aims despite the findings in the GWAS studies.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 1569

Title: Analysis of single nucleotide polymorphisms in the region of CLDN2 - MORC4 in relation to inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer code: 00291381

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2012-12-23 19:03

Date reviewed: 2013-01-11 00:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by S?derman and colleagues examines the impact of polymorphisms in claudin family members. The authors identify a SNP in CLDN2, which predisposes to Crohn's disease in a Swedish population. The result was obtained using a case-control approach, but was not replicated in a family-based study. The paper is interesting and well written: its main limitation lies in the study design, comparing Swedish and non-Swedish individuals using two different approaches. However, this limitation is intrinsic to the paper and as such cannot be amended. A second issue concerns the speculation on the possible effect of the SNP in transcription factor binding: the authors could easily experimentally verify if this is the case and this would certainly add to the message of the paper.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 1569

Title: Analysis of single nucleotide polymorphisms in the region of CLDN2 - MORC4 in relation to inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer code: 00227487

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2012-12-23 19:03

Date reviewed: 2013-01-25 14:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I think this manuscript reports interesting findings. The manuscript is well-written, but I would suggest a minor point: Abbreviations (IBD, CD, UC, IBD-U) can be explained in the footnotes of Tables 1, 4, and 7.