

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6837

**Title:** The enigmatic origin of HBV: an ancient traveling companion or a recent encounter in the evolution of primates?

**Reviewer code:** 00005177

**Science editor:** Cui, Xue-Mei

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-29 18:11

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-10 23:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The review article "THE ENOGRAMATIC ORIGIN OF HBV: AN ANCIENT TRAVELING COMPANION OR A RECENT ENCOUNTER IN THE EVOLUTION OF PRIMATES?" submitted by Dr. Zender G. and coworkers, is interesting, but it is too long and several concepts and sentences are repeated again and again. This makes this interesting paper difficult to read. I suggest the Author to reduce the present manuscript by 50% or more, avoiding the unnecessary repetitions of methods, concepts and sentences. Major points Abstract: The abstract does not include information on HBV subgenotypes. Core Tip: The Core Tip looks like the final part of the abstract. Introduction section: the introduction section is too extended and includes exhaustive information on HBV replication, may be excessive for this review article. This section should be shortened by 50% and directly addressed to the major targets of the review articles. The body of the review article: I think the readers will find of low interest the repeated descriptions of phylogenetic and phylodynamic methods for HBV , genotype D, genotype A, genotype E and genotype F. Also the descriptions of the contents of papers previously published by the Authors or by other Investigators are too extended and should be reduced to the essential. Conclusion section: The Conclusion section is faint and the final message unclear Minor points -There is no homogeneity in the presentation of references, tables and figures in the text. Please check Reference n. 33. - the number of references goes beyond the need and should be reduced by 40%. - The authors should report the reference numbers in table 2. -English should be revised by a mother-tongue teacher.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6837

**Title:** The enigmatic origin of HBV: an ancient traveling companion or a recent encounter in the evolution of primates?

**Reviewer code:** 00035193

**Science editor:** Cui, Xue-Mei

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-29 18:11

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-29 03:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The current study "THE ENIGMATIC ORIGIN OF HBV: AN ANCIENT TRAVELING COMPANION OR A RECENT ENCOUNTER IN THE EVOLUTION OF PRIMATES?" by Zehender et al. attempts at summarizing the main results of the studies on the global phylodynamic and phylogeography of the HBV genotypes and subgenotypes. The review has focused particularly on the two ubiquitous genotypes A and D, and the more restricted E and F. In order to reconcile the possibility of a long evolution of HBV with the high evolutionary rate in recent populations, they proposed the hypothesis of a time dependency of the HBV evolutionary rates, changing according to the genotype and the dynamics of the infected populations. The study overall outlines the complex global evolution and the geographic spread of HBV geno/subgenotypes. The manuscript is timely and should be of interest to the readers. However, the manuscript is too long and there is a great deal of repetitions and overlap. - Introduction section should be polished and shortened and exhaustive information on HBV replication may not be necessary. - The body section has excessive information/description on the phylodynamics of the various HBV genotypes. This section would benefit by reducing the content to essential facts to keep the readers interested. - The authors should report the references in Table 2. Minor comments: -Needs language polishing and spelling checks. -Overlap of the legends in Figure 2 of "E" and "A1, A2, D" needs to be fixed