

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7380

Title: Racial and Gender Differences in Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease

Reviewer code: 00053727

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-18 09:33

Date reviewed: 2013-11-21 17:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good review article on racial and gender differences on NAFLD/NASH. I feel the paper is too long and the matter can be shortened with concise of the information. However, the description of various genotypes involved in NAFLD/NASH can be presented in a Tabular form for easy catch. In addition, HFE mutations, SREBP-2 genotype can also be included in the review.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7380

Title: Racial and Gender Differences in Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease

Reviewer code: 00159281

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-18 09:33

Date reviewed: 2013-11-23 20:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting review article

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7380

Title: Racial and Gender Differences in Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease

Reviewer code: 02520511

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-18 09:33

Date reviewed: 2013-11-27 12:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent work. Well organized and keeps the reader engaged despite dealing with a multitude of papers and concisely summarizes seminal works in the field of racial and gender differences in NAFLD. The data behind the well-recognized fact of high prevalence of NAFLD and also higher likelihood of severe NASH in hispanics has been well summarized. Minor corrections: 1. Under "Prevalence of NAFLD in General Populations" , line 13 - consider changing the verb "lead" to it's past tense form "led" to a 6% loss. In the same section, second paragraph, last sentence - consider changing "have" to "had" in the sentence "Using a more sensitive....Dallas Heart study "have"...In the same section, third paragraph - last line - consider changing "voluntarily" to "voluntary" health check-up. 2. Under "Prevalence of NASH in General Populations" - line 4 - While it is hard to obtain biopsy data from healthy patients, have you considered reviewing the autopsy data published by Lavine et al in this regard? However, it was a pediatric cohort of autopsies. 3. Under "Gender differences in Prevalence of NASH" - 4th paragraph, 6th line - consider altering the sentence to make better grammatical sense - add the word "be" after " who were more likely to BE self-defined as.." 4. Under "Racial/Ethnic Differences in NAFLD and NASH" - second paragraph, second sentence - consider splitting this sentence in to two to deliver the meaning effectively. In the current form, it is "and" has been used twice in quick succession complicating the sentence. 5. Under "Genetic Variations" - second paragraph - line 13 - substitute "PNALA3" with "PNPLA3" Similarly also in third paragraph and 7th paragraph. In the 4th paragraph - change "Finish" to "Finnish" study. In 6th paragraph - first sentence - Add the word "and" after the word ancestry to make it a complete sentence. In the same paragraph (6th) - in the sentence "These findings suggest that development...." delete the word "that"

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7380

Title: Racial and Gender Differences in Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease

Reviewer code: 02520511

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-18 09:33

Date reviewed: 2013-11-27 12:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent work. Well organized and keeps the reader engaged despite dealing with a multitude of papers and concisely summarizes seminal works in the field of racial and gender differences in NAFLD. The data behind the well-recognized fact of high prevalence of NAFLD and also higher likelihood of severe NASH in hispanics has been well summarized. Minor corrections: 1. Under "Prevalence of NAFLD in General Populations", line 13 - consider changing the verb "lead" to it's past tense form "led" to a 6% loss. In the same section, second paragraph, last sentence - consider changing "have" to "had" in the sentence "Using a more sensitive....Dallas Heart study "have"...In the same section, third paragraph - last line - consider changing "voluntarily" to "voluntary" health check-up. 2. Under "Prevalence of NASH in General Populations" - line 4 - While it is hard to obtain biopsy data from healthy patients, have you considered reviewing the autopsy data published by Lavine et al in this regard? However, it was a pediatric cohort of autopsies. 3. Under "Gender differences in Prevalence of NASH" - 4th paragraph, 6th line - consider altering the sentence to make better grammatical sense - add the word "be" after " who were more likely to BE self-defined as.." 4. Under "Racial/Ethnic Differences in NAFLD and NASH" - second paragraph, second sentence - consider splitting this sentence in to two to deliver the meaning effectively. In the current form, it is "and" has been used twice in quick succession complicating the sentence. 5. Under "Genetic Variations" - second paragraph - line 13 - substitute "PNALA3" with "PNPLA3" Similarly also in third paragraph and 7th paragraph. In the 4th paragraph - change "Finish" to "Finnish" study. In 6th paragraph - first sentence - Add the word "and" after the word ancestry to make it a complete sentence. In the same paragraph (6th) - in the sentence "These findings suggest that development...." delete the word "that"

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7380

Title: Racial and Gender Differences in Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease

Reviewer code: 01809219

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-18 09:33

Date reviewed: 2013-12-04 21:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a comprehensive review of the existing scientific literature describing the gender and racial differences in NAFLD. The take-home message of the review is that NAFLD is more prevalent in male and in Hispanics. A strong asset of the review is that authors discuss potential mechanisms implicated in these gender and racial differences. The review is well written and provides an excellent perspective on both historical and present day investigations in the field. It covers the most relevant issues and discusses the latest novelties in the research field. The reference list is extensive and cites the appropriate primary literature. It is the opinion of this reviewer that the manuscript is suitable for publication pending the minor revision described below: The authors extensively discuss a number of variants of several genes that may influence NAFLD in the general population. However, they inadvertently missed the inclusion of two candidate genes of potential relevance to this study: IL-1beta and STAT3. They should include a brief description of the reported SNPs for these genes and their influence in NAFLD. Also, cytochrome P450 variants are shortly mentioned. This gene deserves a further discussion because is a system involved in many metabolic processes. Moreover, this cyt P450 generates biologically active compounds (anti-inflammatory EETs) from fatty acids.