

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31866

Title: Association of obesity and Helicobacter pylori infection: a retrospective study

Reviewer's code: 01136482

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-12-14 20:04

Date reviewed: 2016-12-15 20:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

- Insert the complete acronym at the first time it is reported in the text (e.g. BMI) - Methods section: please added the country where the study was performed (China) - Methods section: i suggest to include in the analysis the value of insulin resistance, that is linked with obesity - Discussion section: Zhang et (2015), reported opposite data on the association between obesity and Hp. One of the possible discordance in this conclusion can be the different population analyzed, and/or the different methods to make diagnosis. Please discuss these points. One more hypothesis on this association can be the increased intestinal permeability, and the role of gut microbiota to induce insulin resistance and liver steatosis (e.g. Abenavoli et al. Med Hypotheses. 2013; Upala et al. Eur J Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2016)

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31866

Title: Association of obesity and Helicobacter pylori infection: a retrospective study

Reviewer's code: 00039368

Reviewer's country: Estonia

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-12-14 20:04

Date reviewed: 2016-12-19 21:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well designed, performed and written retrospective clinical study for the evaluation of association between H. pylori infection and obesity in the population in China. The authors investigated altogether 3039 subjects from 16462 subjects initially participated in the health examination in the hospital. In all recruited subjects a large spectrum of laboratory tests and estimation of H. pylori status using ELISA was performed. The authors give a sufficiently clear overview about the study background and raised clearly the aim of the study, which is fulfilled. The statistical analysis was specified sufficiently well. The material studied is large and fully allows to drawn the conclusions. The Results are presented clearly and have been discussed well. The 3 Tables and 3 Figures of high quality give a good overview about the results. The authors found that the H. pylori infection was not associated with overweight or obesity in studied Chinese population. The interesting point of discussion was the possible effect of H. pylori infection on leptin and gherlin secretion which could protect against intake of large amount of calories in these patients. However the authors have not examined the gherlin and the leptin level in H. pylori positive and negative persons in the present study.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31866

Title: Association of obesity and Helicobacter pylori infection: a retrospective study

Reviewer's code: 00183445

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-12-14 20:04

Date reviewed: 2016-12-21 20:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The work concerns the evaluation of the relationship between obesity and H. pylori infection. In the introduction the Authors emphasized that obesity in recent years is a growing problem. They pointed out that infectious agents can promote the obesity. One of the suspected factors is H. pylori. However, the correlation is not clear. Attention was paid on the contrasting results. The research was observational and retrospective. The occurrence of obesity and changes in BMI have been assessed in the context of H. pylori infection. To analyse the statistical significance of the results the advanced statistical methods have been applied. In total 16462 individuals were included in the study and in real study participated 3039 subjects. Although the study is interesting in my opinion, the assessment of H. pylori infection raises some questions. Serological testing for the presence of anti-H. pylori IgG and IgM does not indicate a current infection. It shows the exposure to these bacteria but not infection. Important would be IgA antibodies, which indicate chronic infection. However, the assay of choice is rather urea breath test. In the project, just such a study should be done. I also have some comments to the Discussion. Interesting information is that H. pylori infection due to effects on leptin and ghrelin protects against intake of larger amount of food by the patients. However, this aspect is



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

poorly described, without citations of the original research.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31866

Title: Association of obesity and Helicobacter pylori infection: a retrospective study

Reviewer's code: 00227386

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-12-14 20:04

Date reviewed: 2016-12-28 00:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Helicobacter pylori infection has been associated falsely with many other disorders apart from peptic ulceration and gastric cancer and this paper shows that there is no evidence for a link with obesity. It takes advantage of an unique access to the records of 16462 patients in the Aerospace Hospital in Beijing of whom 3039 had evidence of H pylori infection and were followed up one year later. The paper is well written except that the English in places is not clear and the idiom in places needs revision. For instance 'obesity' is a noun and the adjective is 'obese', In the Abstract on page three, line 10, the sentence should read "The overall prevalence of H pylori ----" and likewise on line 11 in the Introduction. Again on page 5, line 15 in Material and Methods, it should read "year 2013 from the same population". The Tables and Figures are satisfactory except that it needs to be made clear that Table 3 refers to the same group as in Table 2. There is no need for the word 'cohort' in the caption. One weakness is that the diagnosis is based only on the Elisa Test and there is no information relating to patients who had been eradicated of H pylori, but this is mentioned in the text.