

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4361

Title: FIBROGENESIS IN INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASES: A “TWO-FACED” APPEARING RELATIONSHIP

Reviewer code: 00058872

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-06-28 16:38

Date reviewed: 2013-07-20 20:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The title does not mirror the experience of the Authors. The conclusions should be more impressive.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4361

Title: FIBROGENESIS IN INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASES: A “TWO-FACED” APPEARING RELATIONSHIP

Reviewer code: 00503442

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-06-28 16:38

Date reviewed: 2013-07-26 16:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read with great interest the Review Article entitled “FIBROGENESIS IN INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASES: A “TWO-FACED” APPEARING RELATIONSHIP””, by Principi et al. The Review is well done, timely and interesting. However, the main drawback is the presence of several orthographical and grammatical errors limits its readability and scientific potential. In particular, Title: It reflects the content of the manuscript and is sufficiently attractive. Abstract: It is concise, sufficiently complete and well resumes the entire Review. Keywords: All the reported keywords correctly represent the main field of investigation of the manuscript. Introductory remarks: This section is well written, although the amendment of some orthographical and grammatical errors might improve its readability. I suggest the substitution of the term “Introductory Remarks” with “Introduction”. Final remarks: This Section although too short is appropriate. References: All of the cited references are appropriate.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4361

Title: FIBROGENESIS IN INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASES: A “TWO-FACED” APPEARING RELATIONSHIP

Reviewer code: 00041468

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-06-28 16:38

Date reviewed: 2013-07-27 17:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article of Principi et al. entitled "Fibrogenesis in IBD..." is about an interesting topic, but there are some points that needs revision. Regarding bFGF the authors mention that it is a key regulator of collagen fibrosis in both CD and UC. However, the main characteristics of fibrosis in CD is different from the one in UC. What are the known/suspected major regulatory pathways that may be responsible for these differences? If fibrogenesis is a "two-faced" mechanism, what cytokine/chemokine/cellular factors may regulate the bFGF/syndecan system that makes the fibrogenetic process stricturizing in CD, while not stricturizing in UC? A wider review of the regulation of fibrogenesis in CD and in UC would enhance the strenght of the manuscript. At least the role of TGF-beta must be discussed. English language needs minor polishing. After major revision I suggest to accept the review for publication in WJGP.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4361

Title: FIBROGENESIS IN INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASES: A “TWO-FACED” APPEARING RELATIONSHIP

Reviewer code: 00004520

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-06-28 16:38

Date reviewed: 2013-07-29 22:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This minireview deals with fibrogenesis in inflammatory bowel diseases such as ulcerative colitis and Crohn's disease. Based on their personal experience, on the behavior of TNF-alpha, syndecan 1, and bFGF, the authors describe a possible molecular pattern for mucosal healing and the implications of its deregulation in the fibrotic complication of Crohn's disease. This paper does not sufficiently addresses recent advances on the pathogenesis, epidemiology, diagnosis and therapy of inflammatory bowel diseases. The analysis of the role of TNF-alpha, syndecan 1, and bFGF is poor and based only on authors' observation on anti-TNF alpha treatment. The results of the pattern of TNF alpha, syndecan 1 and bFGF in patients with Crohn's disease complicated by fibrotic stenosis undergoing surgical resection, described only in a short report (an abstract?), appear to be contradictory and the conclusions are speculative. Moreover, the implication of other molecular mechanisms, such as adipokines (Endokrynol Pol. 2013;64(3):226-231), JAK/STAT signaling (Pharmacol Res. 2013 Jul 2;76C:1-8), epigenetic mechanisms (Gastroenterology. 2013 Aug;145(2):293-308). In complex this minireview does not seem to bring new ideas or mechanisms to recently published manuscripts. In summary, I find the opportunity of this review questionable.