

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6800

Title: Ethnic Differences in Genetic Susceptibility to Gastric Cancer: Allele Flips of Interleukin Gene between Asians and Non-Asians

Reviewer code: 00531662

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-30 08:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-31 09:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

As this is the review article, several points may be added for the readers; 1. It will be better if real data (tables and figures) can be summarized. 2. Is there any data with combined polymorphisms of IL-1B and IL-10 which show any association of gastric cancer with location specificity? 3. It will be better if any association can be described between type specificity (diffuse and intestinal type) and specific polymorphism. In the manuscript, there is only short description about the relationship with intestinal type . 4. It will be better how much real production of cytokine is increased based on the polymorphisms. 5. Is there any data about second primary gastric cancer after gastrectomy that is correlated with the polymorphisms? 6. In endemic area, H. pylori is controlled by treatment. In this case, how can we expect the specific polymorphisms with gastric cancer development?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6800

Title: Ethnic Differences in Genetic Susceptibility to Gastric Cancer: Allele Flips of Interleukin Gene between Asians and Non-Asians

Reviewer code: 02534293

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-30 08:07

Date reviewed: 2013-11-02 07:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written manuscript in which the authors summarized the up-to-date data on interleukin gene polymorphisms on the susceptibility of developing gastric cancer. However in my point of view, more than a few points should be noted and have to be discussed: (1) the manuscript describes the impact of interleukin gene polymorphisms on susceptibility to gastric cancer. Unfortunately it is not timely for the more recent studies have established the analytic methods and data for the whole genome-wide association or relation, including interleukin gene although not exclusively, for the development of cancer. (2) the authors wrote that there would be differences in the susceptibility of developing gastric cancer between Westerners and Asian population. It is by far agreed by investigators worldwide, and Asian patients with gastric cancer probably have different tumor biology than Caucasians. But it is still unclear to which extent, what degree or which polymorphisms, the results give us information about the molecular pathogenesis of cancer. (3) I would suggest rewriting some part of the manuscript. It might be very helpful to include study results achieved by the authors themselves, in respect to Asian gastric cancer patients. (4) The overall quality of written English needs some language corrections. The authors need some editorial assistance in English.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6800

Title: Ethnic Differences in Genetic Susceptibility to Gastric Cancer: Allele Flips of Interleukin Gene between Asians and Non-Asians

Reviewer code: 00349930

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-30 08:07

Date reviewed: 2013-11-14 08:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors address an important topic—differences in associations between cytokine polymorphisms and gastric cancer risk by population (Asian versus Caucasian). The authors make some interesting points, for example, regarding functional activity by haplotypes. Unfortunately, the way the paper is currently presented, it is very difficult to follow these points. It would be useful if the authors could reorganize and clarify the paper in a number of ways. 1. From the abstract, it is not clear that this manuscript is in fact a review. I kept waiting to hear what the authors did and why it was important. 2. It would be helpful to clarify why the authors focused on these particular genes/polymorphisms. (Did the authors just choose IL-1B and IL-10 as examples of pro-inflammatory and anti-inflammatory cytokines, or are they the only cytokine polymorphisms that show these kinds of differences by ethnic group?) Also, how did the authors decide which studies and reviews to include? 3. The entire manuscript needs to be organized in a more logical manner. For example, on page 6, the authors introduce the first study that showed an association between pro-inflammatory cytokines and gastric cancer. Then they explain that IL-1B is a pro-inflammatory cytokine involved in a variety of cellular activities, etc. Then they go back to describe the initial study in more detail. That paragraph continues for 3 pages. Explaining more clearly why the commentary focuses on IL-1B and IL-10 would help because the authors could describe their function at that time. Similarly, the description of potential explanations for polymorphism difference by population is currently buried on page 9. In any case, a 3-page paragraph is much too long and must be broken into logical pieces that the reader can follow to understand the argument the authors are trying to make. Currently, it is very difficult to pull out the



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

authors main point and how they got there. 4. Finally, the authors claim that cardia cancer is relatively common among the Caucasians compared to Asians, when in fact, the opposite is true. What the Kamangar paper that the authors cites refer to is a change in the RATES of non-cardia and cardia gastric cancer, not the overall proportion. In fact, noncardia gastric cancer is still more common in Western countries than non-cardia cancer, despite the fact that the rate of noncardia gastric cancer has been decreasing. (See Abrams J Clin Gastroenterol 2013 as one of many examples.) Minor comment: The manuscript would benefit from review by an English editor.