

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Ms:** 3715

**Title:** Predominance of Subgenotype A1 of Hepatitis B Virus in Liver Disease Patients from Kerala, India

**Reviewer code:** 00183339

**Science editor:** s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2013-05-17 11:55

**Date reviewed:** 2013-05-18 16:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This paper aimed to characterized HBV isolates molecularly and related them to the clinical manifestation of infection. The manuscript is well presented and of interest and although it is repetitive, it can contribute to increase the knowledge of this topic.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Ms:** 3715

**Title:** Predominance of Subgenotype A1 of Hepatitis B Virus in Liver Disease Patients from Kerala, India

**Reviewer code:** 02458064

**Science editor:** s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2013-05-17 11:55

**Date reviewed:** 2013-05-21 10:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

**GENERAL COMMENTS** This article investigated the genotypes and subgenotypes of HBV in Kerala, India and described the association between HBV genotype and liver disease. The significance of the research is locally important. The novelty of the research is limited because many papers have reported the similar research. However, the relationship between Pre-S deletion and HCC in this study is a critical and hot point. Some phrases and sentences need polishing. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS** The section "Introduction" should be simplified and the authors can only present the necessary backgrounds of this study. Figure legends should be simplified. In my opinion, Figure 1 can be crossed out. This scientific article should be written in formal English rather than oral English.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Ms:** 3715

**Title:** Predominance of Subgenotype A1 of Hepatitis B Virus in Liver Disease Patients from Kerala, India

**Reviewer code:** 00053786

**Science editor:** s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2013-05-17 11:55

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-01 01:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Deepak Gopalakrishnan et al's study shows that HBV genotype A1 is predominant regardless of the clinical status of chronic HBV-infected liver disease patients. The manuscript is well structured and well written. It contributes to the understanding of the relationship between the HBV variability and clinical outcomes in different populations worldwide. Minor comments: Revise carefully paragraph and word spacing before publishing.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Ms:** 3715

**Title:** Predominance of Subgenotype A1 of Hepatitis B Virus in Liver Disease Patients from Kerala, India

**Reviewer code:** 00054966

**Science editor:** s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2013-05-17 11:55

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-04 17:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

General comments: The research described is to be considered of interest due to its originality and accuracy of the genetic study. The readability and the presentation of the paper are good. The ethics of the research are acceptable. Specific comments: Title: It accurately reflects the major topic and contents of the study. Abstract: It gives a clear delineation of the research background. Material and methods: the methods used are advanced even if not innovative and they are also well described in particular regarding the viral genetic analysis. The points that need to be improved are related to the sample size that results to be too small to obtain reliable statistical conclusions: the total cases enrolled with HBV infection are 91 from a general population (Kerala state) reported by the authors to be of 33 million inhabitants. For the same reason, the statement reported in the results section (demographic, clinical and virological characteristics paragraph) where the authors affirm that the "HBeAg-negative HCC patients, infected with genotype A, were significantly younger than those infected with genotype D" is based on a sample size of 23 patients vs 5 (data deduced by the percentages reported by the authors) that seems to be insufficient. The authors need also to better explain, in the "patients" section, how do they formulate the diagnosis of chronic hepatitis and in particular how many patients underwent liver biopsy (in our opinion the only reliable tool to obtain the diagnosis). The authors report to have used "liver function tests to find necro-inflammatory activity" but this method is not validated and not universally accepted: we suggest to use histological parameters (HAI) only to assess the necro-inflammatory activity. Results: See comments related to the material and methods



## **Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited**

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

---

Discussion: It is well organised and the theoretical analyses are of interest and relevant. The conclusions need to be supported by a larger number of cases analyzed. References: appropriate and updated. Tables and figures: they reflect the major findings.