



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18672

Title: Circulating microRNAs as a novel tool to diagnose and predict prognosis for hepatocellular carcinoma: current knowledge and perspectives

Reviewer’s code: 00068723

Reviewer’s country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-27 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-04-29 06:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript well reports background of micro RNA. The manuscript described current knowledge on micro RNA in HCC. Differentiating HBV related HCC from HCV related HCC was interesting. The authors focused on biomarkers as current diagnostic procedure of HCC. But practically, imaging plays a central role in diagnosis of HCC. Unfortunately, the review did not deal with imaging. This was understandable because the authors focused on biomarkers. To make this review more attractive, the following points should be addressed. Diagnostic procedure of HCC has been established with diagnostic imaging and tumor marker. Current problems are detection of small HCC (for exaple, <1cm), differential diagnosis of small HCC and regenerative nodule of liver cirrhosis. Another problem is detection of recurrence after treatment. How do the authors fit micro RNA into the current diagnostic system?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18672

Title: Circulating microRNAs as a novel tool to diagnose and predict prognosis for hepatocellular carcinoma: current knowledge and perspectives

Reviewer's code: 00503516

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-27 18:45

Date reviewed: 2015-04-29 17:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Yu-Cheng Zhang et described the possible use of circulating miRNAs as novel biomarkers useful for HCC diagnosis and prognosis. The manuscript is clear and well written; additionally it can be of great interest for the readers of the journal. Minor comments -Pag 4 line 22 from top after reference 9: I suggest introducing the reference: "Novel hepatocellular carcinoma molecules with prognostic and therapeutic potentials. Scaggiante et al., World J Gastroenterol 2014 February 7; 20(5): 1268 - 1288; doi:10.3748/wjg.v20.i5.0000" to give the readers the possibility to have a reference for other HCC diagnostic/prognostic markers. -Pag 4 line 23 from top: the word "are" is missing after "technologies". -Pag 6 line 14 from bottom after reference 39: I suggest introducing the reference: "Scaggiante et al., Improving siRNA bio-distribution and minimizing side effects. Current Drug Metabolism 2011, 12, 11-23" to remind the readers that for any miRNA/miRNA considered as therapeutic molecule, the off targeting issue should be always considered. - Pag 8 line 9 from bottom: the words "abundant live-specific miRNAs" should be corrected with "abundant liver-specific miRNAs" - Pag 8 line 4 from bottom: an "a" should be added after the word "was". -



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Pag 9 line 9 from top: an "of" should be added after the word "detection". - Pag 9 line 14 from top: the sentence "Qi et al and Xu et al, their results suggest that serum" should be correct with "Qi et al and Xu et al, suggest that serum " - Pag 10 line 4 from top: the name "tan" should be correct with "Tan". -Pag 14 lines 1-2 from bottom and page 15 lines 1-4 from top: the final sentence of the manuscript is too long and difficult to understand. It should be rephrased and split in at least two sentences