



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2779

Title: Perspectives of gene combinations in phenotype presentation

Reviewer code: 02446280

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-03-14 20:50

Date reviewed: 2013-03-15 13:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript entitled “Perspectives of gene combinations in phenotype presentation” Author recite well known genes involved and connected with different cellular properties, such as proliferation, differentiation, etc. However, it is not clear how these genes or their combinations are really determine or connected with cell specific phenotype. I doubt that Readers of the Journal will find this article interesting and useful. Major drawbacks. 1. It is not clear from the manuscript what Author understands as a cellular phenotype. It is not clear what are perspectives of gene combinations in phenotype (what particular sort of phenotype: morphology, immunomarkers, biochemistry) presentation. No specific links are provided. In some sections Author just provide some immunological cell characteristics without linking it to gene composition (section Molecules and genes involved in stem cell development. Only MCS immunophenotype is provided without referring to any particular gene expression defining this phenotype). 2. In conclusion Author provides the definition of phenotype as his own “gene combinations are indicative of cellular phenotypes”, however does not consider epigenetics environment of gene expression. 3. Some Authors statements supported by controversial citations. Author states that “Recently, concerns about the safety and efficacy of stem cell therapy focusing on induced pluripotent stem (iPS) cells have arisen in that the transplantation of iPS cells causes immunogenicity even in autograft model as embryonic stem cells cause in allogenic transplantation or not [2-5] “. Indeed, some immunogenicity of tumors formed by undifferentiated iPSC cells was observed in one report (ref. 4), however observed immunogenicity was not confirmed in the later studies (ref.5). Even more, no immunogenicity was observed upon transplantation of terminally differentiated iPS cells (ref. 5). I doubt that someone is going to transplant undifferentiated iPSCs. 4. In MOLECULES and GENES



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

INVOLVED in CANCER DEVELOPMENT Author does not provide any clear links with the genes expressed in stem cells.