

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14970

Title: Liver Transplantation for a Giant Mesenchymal Hamartoma of Liver in an Adult: a Case Report

Reviewer's code: 00012156

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-03 09:11

Date reviewed: 2014-11-17 11:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper is a case report of a 37 year old woman with liver transplantation for a giant mesenchymal hamartoma of liver. Mesenchymal hamartoma of liver is rare disease in adults and only 31 patients were reported in the world up to now. Major comments: 1. The informations of mesenchymal hamartoma of liver in adults are necessary, because 31 adult cases were already reported. In this paper only profile of mesenchymal hamartoma of infants is described, therefore, characteristics of this disease in adult are needed in discussion compared with infant. 2. Pathological findings of mesenchymal hamartoma were poor in figure 4. From figure 1, does the diagnosis look like polycystic liver? 3. The description of the operative procedure of the liver Tx were too long. It should be shortened.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14970

Title: Liver Transplantation for a Giant Mesenchymal Hamartoma of Liver in an Adult: a Case Report

Reviewer's code: 02441722

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-03 09:11

Date reviewed: 2014-12-09 16:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: Liver transplantation for a giant mesenchymal hamartoma of liver in an adult: a case report. This manuscript is very interesting and well written. However, I feel there are some problems in this article. (1) In this case, the histological evidence is poor for the diagnosis of mesenchymal hamartoma. Author should indicate the clear evidence and reason for the diagnosis of mesenchymal hamartoma of liver in Case Report. This is the most important point of this manuscript. (2) Author should change the photographs in Fig 3 to more clear photographs at high magnification. (3) Author has indicated that mesenchymal hamartoma of liver in adults as a rare. Then, Author should add the Table of the literatures which indicate the previous cases, if possible. (4) Author should change "a-fetoprotein" to "alpha-fetoprotein (AFP)" or "α-fetoprotein (AFP)". (5) Author should add the full spelling of "DCD" in Case Report.