

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25548

Title: Co-existence of non-alcoholic fatty liver disease and inflammatory bowel disease: a review article

Reviewer's code: 03023823

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-15 10:04

Date reviewed: 2016-03-15 19:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript's content is somewhat interesting but this review is addressed almost exclusively to association studies, with several methodological bias not adequately declared. Scope should be better and concisely expressed: fatty liver? Nash? Nafld? Format is somewhat erratic, from the minireview to the editorial's statements and last, to a short communication. Priority is unclear since most concepts are quite questionable and not well justified, Novelty is very limited, and interest should be mainly "professional" but the teaching and narrative style should be improved: a review article like this one deserves a greater care. English, spelling and syntax of a few sentences need some reappraisal. Mechanisms of disease: something not studied in IBD should be available in NAFLD. The likely lack, in the quoted studies, of information on quality of dietary intake and of physical activity should be checked, quoted and, if present, quoted as a limitation of the available studies. Malnutrition, in any way defined, should be considered looking inside the data of some of the chosen studies.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25548

Title: Co-existence of non-alcoholic fatty liver disease and inflammatory bowel disease: a review article

Reviewer's code: 00070280

Reviewer's country: Sri Lanka

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-15 10:04

Date reviewed: 2016-04-01 15:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a nice article on a very interesting association. However, the authors need to discuss if there is any genetic association between IBD and NAFLD genes.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25548

Title: Co-existence of non-alcoholic fatty liver disease and inflammatory bowel disease: a review article

Reviewer's code: 00053433

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-15 10:04

Date reviewed: 2016-04-11 03:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review article on the relationship between non-alcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD) and inflammatory bowel disease (IBD). The manuscript is generally well written and has scientific value, since it includes a comprehensive compilation of relevant studies on the subject. Two suggestions are listed below. 1. Considering that anti-TNF-alpha agents are commonly used in IBD and the current controversy in the literature about its relationship with NAFLD, it is suggested to include anti-TNF-alpha in Figure 1, in the section "Prolonged medication use", replacing "hepatotoxic medications". 2. Authors are suggested to further discuss the potential impact of small bowel resection on the risk of NAFLD in IBD patients. The inclusion of such association in Figure 1 should be considered.