

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14517

Title: A Case of Cytomegalovirus Colitis Followed by Ischemic Colitis in Non-immunocompromised Adult

Reviewer code: 02935930

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-10-09 14:39

Date reviewed: 2014-10-18 16:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1.The title reflected the major topic accurately. 2.The abstract not only provided a clear delineation between the Cytomegalovirus, Cytomegalovirus colitis, immunocompromised patients and immunocompetent patients, but also introduced the diagnosis , treatment and prognosis of the non-immunocompromised patient who suffered Cytomegalovirus colitis. 3.The part of case report provided sufficient detailed descriptions such as the past medical history, the symptoms, serologic test results, colonoscopy results and the immunohistochemical findings for the correct diagnosis. The part has a strong logical and authenticity. 4.The discussion is well organized. It tells us that Cytomegalovirus (CMV) colitis occurs rarely in immunocompetent patients and little detail is known about the clinical features, endoscopic findings and prognosis of CMV colitis in immunocompetent patients. 5.This article may provide a basis for people to investigate the clinical and endoscopic features of CMV colitis and its prognosis in immunocompetent patients in the future.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14517

Title: A Case of Cytomegalovirus Colitis Followed by Ischemic Colitis in Non-immunocompromised Adult

Reviewer code: 02941672

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-10-09 14:39

Date reviewed: 2014-10-18 23:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case is very rare but includes some suggestive points with interest. I listed some comments for further improvement as follows. 1, The diagnosis of ischemic colitis is insufficient. The finding without abdominal pain is not typical. What percentage of ischemic colitis patients not showing abdominal pain? In addition, the authors noted that the biopsy specimens showed acute colitis compatible with ischemic colitis; but, do they include characteristic observations such as ghost-like appearance? 2, It is easy to understand if the clinical course of this patient including physical status and laboratory data is shown by graph. 3, The results of stool culture at the first visit needs to be presented to exclude infectious colitis. 4, Page 4 line 2; The duration and frequency of vomiting and diarrhea should be described. 5, Page 5 line 8; "Fosmicin" needs to be changed to "fosfomycin calcium hydrate".



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14517

Title: A Case of Cytomegalovirus Colitis Followed by Ischemic Colitis in Non-immunocompromised Adult

Reviewer code: 00057560

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-10-09 14:39

Date reviewed: 2014-10-22 22:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is true that Colitis due to CMV is rare in immune competent patients and all patients show good response to anti viral treatment. There are some flaws in the manuscript. 1. What was done with the stenosing segment of colon because that is ought to lead to obstruction in future. What about the follow of the patient. 2. The manuscript is not written properly. It needs to be rewritten by English knowing person. 3. The paper needs a major revision.