

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19684

Title: Strategies to optimize the use of marginal donors in liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00842377

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-05-20 15:35

Date reviewed: 2015-06-10 07:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I enjoyed reading this comprehensive review of liver transplantation using ECD grafts. However, similar review articles have been published in the past, so that I don't know how much the current version contributes to improve our practice. Here are my suggestions that I would like the authors to address. 1. There is no description regarding split liver transplantation in this review. The split graft is one of the important ECD grafts, which should be discussed. This includes not only child-adult sharing using left lateral and right trisegment grafts, but also adult-adult combination using full left and right grafts. 2. In "Malignancy", I would suggest to add more detailed information of donors with history of melanoma and brain tumor. 3. Recently, it has been reported that donor and recipient matching is important to achieve better survival after liver transplantation. I realized that the authors described some of the important points of donor and recipient pairing, but this should be discussed more. 4. The use of porto-caval shunt is controversial and I believe many centers do not use it during liver implantation.