



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 58305

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma after direct-acting antiviral HCV therapy: A debate near the end

Reviewer's code: 03765071

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-07-16

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-10 23:51

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-14 10:54

Review time: 3 Days and 11 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present review article, Muzica et al. discussed the relationship between DAA therapy for HCV infection and occurrence and recurrence of HCC. They concluded that DAA therapy suppress the risk of HCC after achieving SVR based on the recent results of retrospective and prospective studies. The authors compactly summarized the findings of recent researches; however, its impact is unsatisfactory after several meta-analyses and epidemiological studies in terms of this topic have already been published. 1. The recurrence of HCC can be stratified into (1) intra-hepatic metastasis of the original tumor and (2) multicentric carcinogenesis. If SVR is achieved by DAA therapy and progression of liver fibrosis is suppressed, multicentric carcinogenesis could be suppressed theoretically. However, tumor recurrence is frequently found after curative treatments for HCC. The authors are requested to refer to this issue based on the findings of the previous works.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 58305

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma after direct-acting antiviral HCV therapy: A debate near the end

Reviewer's code: 03738365

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-07-16

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-10 11:46

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-16 17:26

Review time: 6 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The last paragraph of the section of "THE RELATION BETWEEN HCC AND CHRONIC HCV INFECTION" does not seem to be related to the subject of this part. It is recommended to delete it and move the relevant content to the section of "RISK FACTORS FOR DE NOVO AND RECURRENT HCC". 2. In the section of "HCC OCCURRENCE AFTER DAA THERAPY", the authors reviewed and cited a large number of articles, but the order is quite messy, and the interrelationships between the various studies are puzzling. It is recommended to classify articles according to the similarity of the studies, such as: research type (retrospective, prospective), conclusions (support, against), number of cases (single-center, multi-center), etc. Each category should aggregate into separate paragraphs and add corresponding subtitles to describe separately. It would be convenient for readers to read and understand more clearly. In the section of "HCC RECURRENCE AFTER DAA THERAPY" and "RISK FACTORS FOR DE NOVO AND RECURRENT HCC", the above problems also exist. It is recommended to also aggregate each category into separate paragraphs with corresponding subtitles. 3. For some reference, the results and conclusions cited by the authors are puzzling. Such as: Among patients with SVR to DAAs, the incidence rate of HCC was 6.9 per 1000 PY, while in individuals with SVR to IFN, the incidence rate of HCC was 1.8 per 1000 PY. The authors concluded that similarly to the interferon era, DAA-related SVR is associated with a 70% reduction in HCC risk [41]. Why is 6.9 similar to 1.9? The author seems to quote the results and conclusions directly from the abstract. It is recommended that authors quote more convincing content in the original manuscript. 4. Some references are too old. For example: the first reference. The latest article is "Global Cancer Statistics 2018 GLOBOCAN Estimates of Incidence and Mortality Worldwide for 36 Cancers in 185 Countries". It is recommended to cite



Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

updated reference.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 58305

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma after direct-acting antiviral HCV therapy: A debate near the end

Reviewer's code: 00068781

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-07-16

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-16 03:09

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-18 09:55

Review time: 2 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors review the most recent and relevant articles regarding the risk of HCC after DAA treatment and found a reduced incidence rate of both de novo and recurrent HCC after achieving SVR with DAA therapy, and considered that the debate regarding the impact of DAAs on HCC risk is drawing to an end. The quality and importance of this manuscript is good, and the conclusions appropriately summarize the data that this study provided. The author may appropriately enriches the research basis of HCV causing hepatocellular carcinoma .



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 58305

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma after direct-acting antiviral HCV therapy: A debate near the end

Reviewer's code: 03765071

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-07-16

Reviewer chosen by: Pan Huang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-28 12:27

Reviewer performed review: 2020-10-05 11:03

Review time: 6 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

In the revised manuscript, the authors have responded appropriately to the questions raised by the reviewers. Therefore, I have no additional comments to the revised manuscript.