



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9829

Title: Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis (MAP) causes Crohn’s disease: the whole story

Reviewer code: 00504462

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2014-03-01 20:41

Date reviewed: 2014-03-11 10:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Sir, The historical review, as well as the comprehensive data of Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis (MAP) is impressive and worth reading. However, even though there seems to be a relation between CD and MAP, you seem to approach it solely from an epidemiological standpoint. Currently, your detection PCR technique looking for the IS900 seems very promising! However you do not show whether there are any animal models that supports this pathogenic relationship, or whether there have been any successful therapeutic approaches to eradicate MAP. So for the moment, the only real association between both entities is epidemiological, and unlike what your title says, you can only conclude there is a correlation, but you cannot make any conclusions about causality. Hope to hear from you soon.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9829

Title: Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis (MAP) causes Crohn’s disease: the whole story

Reviewer code: 00680628

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2014-03-01 20:41

Date reviewed: 2014-03-14 23:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A causal association between Mycobacterium avium paratuberculosis (MAP) and Crohn's disease (CD) has never been proven or excluded to date. This review showed that the link between MAP and CD varied by different studies and methods used. The major shortage in this manuscript is lack of evidence to support the causal role of MAP in CD. At its present form, the authors did not provide evidence to confirm that “MAP causes CD. The authors should address these points and extensively revised the manuscript.



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9829

Title: Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis (MAP) causes Crohn’s disease: the whole story

Reviewer code: 00044980

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2014-03-01 20:41

Date reviewed: 2014-03-16 23:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article shows the relation between Crohn’s disease (CD) and MAP. It is very interesting, however, I have some of comments described as follows. 1. INRODUCTION section includes the history of CD, however, it is long. Authors should omit the history and shorten it. 2. In WHO IS AFFECTED BY CD? section : Authors mention prevalence of CD. If infection of MAP is related to prevalence of CD, please mention the relation. If it is not related, authors had better omit this paragraph. 3. Authors had better omit DIAGNOSIS OF CD section. 4. Please correct the form of references.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9829

Title: Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis (MAP) causes Crohn's disease: the whole story

Reviewer code: 00031299

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2014-03-01 20:41

Date reviewed: 2014-03-18 08:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The information contained in Naser's article is clearly presented and allows the reader to measure the pros and cons of the controversial issue as to whether MAP has a role in the etiopathogenesis of Crohn's Disease. This article should be published with only minor changes. It should be edited for minor grammatical changes. I have listed the lines that should be looked at. 30- add commas 34 - s to human 62 - of CD 93 - no of 107 - a patchy 120-122 - clarify 137 - twenties - not tweens 139 - to or by 142 - 160: This whole section can be reduced to a few sentences. The audience is well aware of how CD is diagnosed. 162 - 'are' is needed 185-186 - revise? 234 - 'a few' or 'special' 241 - reword 263 - 265 - not clear 338-339 - reword 352 - humans 361 - What is truly 404 - an extra 'the' 408 - antibiotic, not antibiotics 410 - prior to submission 444-452 - needs editing for missing words 353 - Clarify what the definition of a positive test in the scheme submitted. Does 1 of the 3, 2 of the 3, or all 3 (MGIT culture and then DNA extraction, direct bacterial DNA extraction and MAP antibodies).



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9829

Title: Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis (MAP) causes Crohn's disease: the whole story

Reviewer code: 00914743

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2014-03-01 20:41

Date reviewed: 2014-03-25 22:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Crohn's disease (CD) is a chronic inflammatory condition that plagues millions all over the world. However, little is still understood about the cause(s) of CD. One theory indicated that MAP is linked to the etiology of CD. In this review article, data from the detection and isolation of MAP by PCR and culture techniques have been reviewed. This is a good story about MAP causes CD. We have the following suggestions: 1. There some errors in the article format. e.g.: Line 238, 302, With no spaces at the first word; line 445, need delete the comma which after question mark. 2. The investigators in these studies to be commended on their interest to question whether or not MAP is associated with CD? However, this paper using lots of word to describe the relationship between MAP and John's disease is not important. We proposal to delete this part, so will highlight the relationship MAP and CD. 3. The article is too long for the background of the MAP research, especially for the parts of "transmission of MAP and milk", and the part of "prevalence of MAP in the water". This two parts is not well associated with CD. We suggest compress the relative two parts.