

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20143

Title: Gut microbiota role in IBS: new therapeutic strategies

Reviewer's code: 00029592

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-06-01 09:55

Date reviewed: 2015-09-30 01:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

-English should be revised throughout the whole text: the authors should remove typing errors and revise the punctuation. -In the part MICROBIOTA AND IBS, when the authors use the example of IBD, they should motivate their claim with appropriate citations. -About Putative mechanisms of action of probiotics, in the subgroups Gastrointestinal dysmotility, Epithelial barrier/Intestinal inflammation/Immune activation, Dysfunction of brain-gut axis and psychological distress it would be more interesting to evaluate the effects of the various species of probiotics, as it has been done in the other subgroups. -In the part PREBIOTICS, it would be more interesting to discuss also the possible role of FODMAP diet, evaluating the effects on the modifications of gut microbiota.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20143

Title: Gut microbiota role in IBS: new therapeutic strategies

Reviewer's code: 02533618

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-06-01 09:55

Date reviewed: 2015-10-11 19:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1)The authors did a wide literature survey. However the following issues should also be discussed; microbiota- expression of pattern recognition receptors- hypothalamus-pituitary-adrenal stress axis and breakdown of the mucosal barrier- modulation neuro-immune signalling, modulation of enteric neurons, visceral hypersensitivity and altered colonic motility. 2)Also there are only 7 references in this review related to fecal transplantation. This issue should also be discussed in more details as this is one of the most recent treatment alternative. 3)The reference numbers should be checked. 4)There are minor grammatical and spelling errors.