



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15464

Title: Insights into glycan biosynthesis of chemically-induced hepatocellular carcinoma in rats: A Glycomic Analysis

Reviewer’s code: 02822399

Reviewer’s country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-27 10:01

Date reviewed: 2014-12-13 03:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Amin and colleagues evaluated the qualitative and quantitative changes in N-linked glycosylation that occurs in association with Diethyl Nitrosamine (DEN)-induced HCC in rats. They did good work and used modern techniques to illustrate their conclusion. I have some comments: - Many previous studies illustrated the changes in N-linked glycosylation in HCC. What is the novelty of your work? Illustrate this in the introduction. - You decided that you have rats with HCC by formation of abnormal nodules of FAH. These nodules may represent only fibrosis not HCC. GST-p also can be a marker of liver fibrosis. How did you make sure you have rats with HCC. You did not make any other parameters. - In the statistical analysis section, you used ANOVA test, which is used when we have more than two groups, while throughout your results you only compare between two groups (normal and HCC). - You have a part in your methods called statistical analysis but I did find anything about the presence or absence of significant changes in your results and figures. You only wrote slight decrease or increase without writing it is significant or not. Your figures also did not show any sign of significance. - Under the title “Mass Spectrometric Analysis” in Methods: it is



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

figure 2a not 1a - In figure 1: the resolution of images is low and does not show any details of the cells.
- Table 1 is only an image with low resolution and I cannot read its content. - In results part under title "High mannose glycans were increased": you described the increase of some parameters and the decrease in others. Are these changes significant or not? The figure 4 showed no significant change.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15464

Title: Insights into glycan biosynthesis of chemically-induced hepatocellular carcinoma in rats: A Glycomic Analysis

Reviewer's code: 02992497

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-27 10:01

Date reviewed: 2014-12-08 15:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors identified specific glycans for HCC tissue. I think, however, it may preferential to focus serum for biomarkers or dissected tumors not but whole liver-bearing HCC. Major comments 1. I recommend the statistic summary of Hepatic nodules, such as size and differentiation. Important point is that the correlation of glycan amount and HCC progressions. 2. I recommend the serum level of the glycans. Because, the level of sialyl-Lewis glycans was increased in HCC-bearing rats but fucosylated or sialylated glycans, which were changed in serum in previous studies did not increase in HCC liver tissues in this study. 3. The authors should clearly display the number of samples in each experiment. 4. Regard with ER mannosidase I, the authors should describe about not only the increased Man9 but also the decreased Man5 in HCC. Minor comment 1. I recommend the Glycan profiles of all samples.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15464

Title: Insights into glycan biosynthesis of chemically-induced hepatocellular carcinoma in rats: A Glycomic Analysis

Reviewer's code: 02992458

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-27 10:01

Date reviewed: 2014-12-18 16:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors evaluate the qualitative and quantitative changes in N-linked glycosylation that occurs in association with Diethyl Nitrosamine (DEN)-induced HCC in rodents. Results found that five glycans have significantly altered in HCC rats compared with normal rats. These findings provide some new index to diagnose the HCC, which has potential applications in clinic. I think it is can be accept. However, some minor revision should be done before publication. 1.The number of rats of normal/HCC groups should be provided. 2. Please provide exact p values throughout. 3. Some title in results is not appropriate. For example, "Five glycans showed significant drift from normal", "High mannose glycans were increased. ", et al, it is a result but not a title, please revise them.