

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6202

Title: Autophagy in HCV-Host Interactions: a Potential Role and Therapeutic Target for Liver-Associated Diseases

Reviewer code: 00007944

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 08:47

Date reviewed: 2013-11-18 01:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review provided by Po-Yuan Ke and Steve S.-L. Chen is extremely valuable but a few modifications should be added: 1) The first chapters that overview HCV infection and autophagy should be consistently reduced and only elements of HCV replication and autophagy which are considered to be related in possible pathogenetic interplays (in the second part of the review) should be outlined in details. Accordingly figures should illustrate more specific elements of the possible interplays between HCV replication and autophagy. 2) Because of these reasons above, figures should be different. Figure 2 should rather describe the viral RNA replication via its peculiar replication complex within multi-vesiculated, membranous web rather than the HCV poly-protein processing. Figure 3 is useless and not pertinent to the issue and it should be substituted by another outlining instead the possible key targets of viral replication and autophagy. 3) More attention should be given to the issue of steatosis induced by HCV infection and particularly to differences between genotypes (namely HCV gen 3 and others). 4) There are compelling evidences that modulation of autophagy may have therapeutic implications in therapy of liver diseases associated as well with steatosis as alpha -1 anti-trypsin deficiency (see manuscript by Pastore N (EMBO Mol Med (2013) 5, 397-412).

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6202

Title: Autophagy in HCV-Host Interactions: a Potential Role and Therapeutic Target for Liver-Associated Diseases

Reviewer code: 00504267

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 08:47

Date reviewed: 2013-12-05 05:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review paper is well written about Autophagy in HCV infection.