



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9739

**Title:** The prognostic role of gastrectomy with bursectomy in gastric cancer: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer code:** 00058136

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-27 09:23

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-09 17:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is nicely written manuscript providing important information about bursectomy of advanced technique for treatment of gastric cancer. I have one question: As you mentioned, Japanese gastric cancer treatment guidelines recommended bursectomy for tumors with invasion of the serosa, but not in T1/T2 tumors. However, the 3 eligible studies have clinical or pathological stage I-II patients. The stage of the tumor differed in 4 study group, which can potentially result in differences in the parameters measured. As an intended selection of the patients can make a serious bias, please describe the detailed tumor stage of the eligible 4 studies in the method session.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com <http://www.wjgnet.com>

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9739

**Title:** The prognostic role of gastrectomy with bursectomy in gastric cancer: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer code:** 02732351

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-27 09:23

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-13 22:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article is helpful to the clinical management of patients with gastric cancer.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9739

**Title:** The prognostic role of gastrectomy with bursectomy in gastric cancer: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer code:** 02572312

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-27 09:23

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-14 00:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting article on Bursectomy in stomach cancer The selection of studies included in the study is strictly made but limited thereby the interest of the statistical analysis. The selected studies are 4 but 5 are listed in Table 1. Reasons explained in the text should be corrected in table 1 One series is randomized. Analyzed series do not follow strictly the guidelines including patients with stage 1 and 2. This reduces the interest of the statistical analysis. One would wish to have more information concerning complications and their impact on the duration of hospitalization for example. This article does not provide a clear answer on whether or not making a Bursectomy. This can be due to the number of items and the lack of statistical significance.